

DRAFT

## **AN AUTOMATED EQUATIONAL LOGIC DERIVATION OF THE IMPLICATIONAL EQUIVALENCE OF THE PRINCIPIA MATHEMATICA AND ŁUKASIEWICZ'S CN SENTENTIAL CALCULI**

Author: J. Horner, jhorner@cybermesa.com

Last modified: 4 July 2021/0940 CT

### **Abstract**

*Two logics are implicationaly equivalent if the axioms and inference rules of each imply the axioms of the other. Using the automated equational logic deduction system contained in Mathematica , I show the implicational equivalence of the Principia Mathematica (PM) and Łukasiewicz's CN sentential calculi. The proof appears to be novel.*

### **1.0 Introduction**

Two logics are implicationaly equivalent if the axioms and inference rules of each imply the axioms of the other.

Section 2 contains a summary of an automated equational logic derivation of the implicational equivalence of Łukasiewicz's CN sentential calculus ([1]; hereafter abbreviated "CN") and the sentential calculus of *Principia Mathematica* ([2]; hereafter abbreviated "PM")

### **1.1 Some terminology**

I assume the definitions of term, value of a term, variable, and constant contained in [4], Chapter 3.

A *rewriting system* is a system of R rules that transforms expressions that satisfy some well-defined set of formation rules to another expression that satisfy those formation rules. For the purposes of this paper, I restrict "rewriting system" to a rewriting system that concerns identities of terms.

Two terms are said to be *identical* if the values of the terms are equal for all values of variables occurring in them.

A *reduction of a term  $T$  to a term  $T'$*  is a (typically recursive) rewriting of  $T$  to  $T'$  using a set of rewriting rules  $R$  such that  $T'$  is “simpler than”  $T$  (given some definition of “simpler than”). A *reduction sequence of a term  $T$  to a term  $T'$*  is a sequence  $T_0 = T, T_1, T_2, T_3, \dots, T_n = T'$ , where each  $T_i$  is the result of applying  $R$  to  $T_{i-1}$ ,  $i = 1, 2, \dots, n$ .

If “simpler than” is a partial ordering ([5], Df. 21, 72) on a reduction sequence that begins with  $T$  and ends with  $T'$  in a system with a set of rewriting rules  $R$ , “simpler than” induces a reduction order ([4], 102) on the reduction sequence that begins with  $T$  and ends with  $T'$ . A term  $T_n$  is *in normal form* if no application of  $R$  to  $T_n$  changes  $T_n$ .

A rewriting system is said to be *finitely terminating* if every reduction sequence of any term  $T$  produces, in a finite number of iterations, a normal form of  $T$ . A rewriting system is said to be *confluent* if the normal forms of all terms in the system are unique.

Some term rewriting systems are both finitely terminating and confluent ([4], esp. Chapter 9). Such rewriting systems have unique normal forms for all expressions. This permits us to use the the output of such a system to determine whether there is an identity between two terms  $T_1$  and  $T_2$  in the following manner. If  $T_1$  and  $T_2$  and have the same normal form, then there is an identity between  $T_1$  and  $T_2$ . Otherwise, there is not an identity.

## 1.2 Mathematica’s equational logic inference algorithm

The inference algorithm in Mathematica’s ADF is the Knuth-Bendix completion algorithm ([6]). KBC attempts to transform a given finite set of identities (an “input” to KBC) to a finitely terminating, confluent term rewriting system that preserves identity. At initialization, KBC attempts to “orient” the identities supplied in its input according to the KnuthBendix reduction order ([4], Section 5.4.4). This results in an initial set of reduction rules. KBC then attempts to complete this initial set of rules with additional rules, obtaining their normal forms, and adding a new rule for every pair of the normal forms in accordance with the reduction order.

KBC may

1. Terminate with success, yielding a finitely terminating, confluent set of rules, or
2. Terminate with failure, or
3. Loop without terminating.

## 2.0 Proof of “The CN and PM sentential calculi are implicationaly equivalent”

The *Mathematica* ([3]) script shown in this section was executed on a Dell Inspiron 545 with an Intel Core2 Quad CPU Q8200 @ 2.33 GHz and 8.00 GB RAM, running under Windows 10.

cn1 - cn3 are the axioms of Łukasiewicz's sentential calculus, expressed in *Mathematica* notation.

In[1]:= **cn1 = ForAll[{x, y, z}, Implies[Implies[x, y], Implies[Implies[y, z], Implies[x, z]]]]**

Out[1]=  $\forall_{\{x,y,z\}} ((x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow ((y \Rightarrow z) \Rightarrow (x \Rightarrow z)))$

In[2]:= **cn2 = ForAll[{x, y}, Implies[x, Implies[Not[x], y]]]**

Out[2]=  $\forall_{\{x,y\}} (x \Rightarrow (! x \Rightarrow y))$

In[3]:= **cn3 = ForAll[x, Implies[Implies[Not[x], x], x]]**

Out[3]=  $\forall_x ((! x \Rightarrow x) \Rightarrow x)$

In[4]:= **CNAxioms = {cn1, cn2, cn3}**

Out[4]=  $\{\forall_{\{x,y,z\}} ((x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow ((y \Rightarrow z) \Rightarrow (x \Rightarrow z))), \forall_{\{x,y\}} (x \Rightarrow (! x \Rightarrow y)), \forall_x ((! x \Rightarrow x) \Rightarrow x)\}$

pm1 - pm5 are the axioms of the sentential calculus of Principia Mathematica, expressed in *Mathematica* notation.

In[5]:= **pm1 = ForAll[{x, y}, Implies[y, Implies[Not[x], y]]]**

Out[5]=  $\forall_{\{x,y\}} (y \Rightarrow (! x \Rightarrow y))$

In[6]:= **pm2 = ForAll[x, Implies[Implies[Not[x], x], x]]**

Out[6]=  $\forall_x ((! x \Rightarrow x) \Rightarrow x)$

In[7]:= **pm3 = ForAll[{x, y}, Implies[Implies[Not[x], y], Implies[Not[y], x]]]**

Out[7]=  $\forall_{\{x,y\}} ((! x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow (! y \Rightarrow x))$

In[8]:= **pm4 =**

**ForAll[{x, y, z}, Implies[Implies[y, z], Implies[Implies[Not[x], y], Implies[Not[x], z]]]]**

Out[8]=  $\forall_{\{x\}} ((y \Rightarrow z) \Rightarrow ((! x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow (! x \Rightarrow z)))$

In[9]:= **pm5 = ForAll[{x, y, z},**

**Implies[Implies[Not[x], Implies[Not[y], z]], Implies[Not[y], Implies[Not[x], z]]]]**


Out[9]=  $\forall_{\{x,y,z\}} ((! x \Rightarrow (! y \Rightarrow z)) \Rightarrow (! y \Rightarrow (! x \Rightarrow z)))$

In[10]:= **pmAxioms = {pm1, pm2, pm3, pm4, pm5}**


Out[10]=  $\{\forall_{\{x,y\}} (y \Rightarrow (! x \Rightarrow y)), \forall_x ((! x \Rightarrow x) \Rightarrow x), \forall_{\{x,y\}} ((! x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow (! y \Rightarrow x)), \forall_{\{x\}} ((y \Rightarrow z) \Rightarrow ((! x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow (! x \Rightarrow z))), \forall_{\{x,y,z\}} ((! x \Rightarrow (! y \Rightarrow z)) \Rightarrow (! y \Rightarrow (! x \Rightarrow z)))\}$

Proof that CN implies PM.


In[11]:= **proofCNimppm1 = FindEquationalProof[pm1, CNaxioms]**

Out[11]= ProofObject [  Logic: Predicate/EquationalLogic Steps: 51  
Theorem:  $\forall_{\{x,y\}} (y \Rightarrow (!x \Rightarrow y))$  ]


In[12]:= **proofCNimppm2 = FindEquationalProof[pm2, CNaxioms]**

Out[12]= ProofObject [  Logic: Predicate/EquationalLogic Steps: 17  
Theorem:  $\forall_x ((!x \Rightarrow x) \Rightarrow x)$  ]


In[13]:= **proofCNimppm3 = FindEquationalProof[pm3, CNaxioms]**

Out[13]= ProofObject [  Logic: Predicate/EquationalLogic Steps: 49  
Theorem:  $\forall_{\{x,y\}} ((!x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow (!y \Rightarrow x))$  ]

In[14]:= **proofCNimppm4 = FindEquationalProof[pm4, CNaxioms]**


Out[14]= ProofObject [  Logic: Predicate/EquationalLogic Steps: 69  
Theorem:  $\forall_{\{x\}} ((y \Rightarrow z) \Rightarrow ((!x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow (!x \Rightarrow z)))$  ]

In[15]:= **proofCNimppm5 = FindEquationalProof[pm5, CNaxioms]**


Out[15]= ProofObject [  Logic: Predicate/EquationalLogic Steps: 87  
Theorem:  $\forall_{\{x,y,z\}} ((!x \Rightarrow (!y \Rightarrow z)) \Rightarrow (!y \Rightarrow (!x \Rightarrow z)))$  ]

Proof of PM implies CN.


In[16]:= **proofPMimpCN1 = FindEquationalProof[cn1, PMAxioms]**

Out[16]= ProofObject [  Logic: Predicate/EquationalLogic Steps: 98  
Theorem:  $\forall_{\{x,y,z\}} ((x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow ((y \Rightarrow z) \Rightarrow (x \Rightarrow z)))$  ]

In[17]:= **proofPMimpCN2 = FindEquationalProof[cn2, PMAxioms]**

Out[17]= ProofObject [  Logic: Predicate/EquationalLogic Steps: 36  
Theorem:  $\forall_{\{x,y\}} (x \Rightarrow (!x \Rightarrow y))$  ]

In[18]:= **proofPMimpCN3 = FindEquationalProof[cn3, PMAxioms]**

Out[18]= ProofObject [  Logic: Predicate/EquationalLogic Steps: 24  
Theorem:  $\forall_x ((!x \Rightarrow x) \Rightarrow x)$  ]

## APPENDIX 1. Proof of CN implies PM1.

In[19]:= proofCNimppm1 [ "ProofNotebook" ]



### Axiom 1

We are given that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y,z\}} ( (x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow ( (y \Rightarrow z) \Rightarrow (x \Rightarrow z) ) )$$

### Axiom 2

We are given that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y\}} ( x \Rightarrow ( ! x \Rightarrow y ) )$$

### Axiom 3

We are given that:

$$\forall_x ( ( ! x \Rightarrow x ) \Rightarrow x )$$

### Hypothesis 1

We would like to show that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y\}} ( y \Rightarrow ( ! x \Rightarrow y ) )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 1

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$x1 == ( x1 | | ( x2 \&\& ! x2 ) )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 2

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$x1 == ( x1 \&\& ( x2 | | ! x2 ) )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 3

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$( x1 | | x2 ) == ( x2 | | x1 )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 4

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$( x1 | | ( x2 \&\& x3 ) ) == ( ( x1 | | x2 ) \&\& ( x1 | | x3 ) )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 5

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$( ! x1 | | x1 | | x2 ) == ( a_0 | | ! a_0 )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 6

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$( ! ( ! x1 | | x2 ) | | ! ( ! x2 | | x3 ) | | ! x1 | | x3 ) == ( a_0 | | ! a_0 )$$

## Equationalized Axiom 7

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(! (x_1 | x_1) | x_1) = (a_0 | ! a_0)$$

## Equationalized Axiom 8

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$((x_1 \&\&x_2) | (x_1 \&\&x_3)) = (x_1 \&\&(x_2 | x_3))$$

## Equationalized Axiom 9

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x_1 \&\&x_2) = (x_2 \&\&x_1)$$

## Equationalized Hypothesis 1

We generate the "equationalized" hypothesis:

$$(! y_0 | x_1 | y_0) = (a_0 | ! a_0)$$

## Critical Pair Lemma 1

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$((x_1 \&\&! x_1) | x_2) = x_2$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x_1\_ | x_2\_ \leftrightarrow x_2\_ | x_1\_$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x_1\_ | x_2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x_1\_ | (x_2\_ \&\&! x_2\_ ) \rightarrow x_1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 3 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 1

It can be shown that:

$$(! (! x_1 | x_2) | ! (! x_2 | x_3) | ! x_1 | x_3) = (! x_1 | x_1 | x_1)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Equationalized Axiom 6, and apply the substitution:

$$a_0 | ! a_0 \rightarrow ! x_1 | x_1 | x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 5.

## Substitution Lemma 2

It can be shown that:

$$(! (! x_1 | x_2) | ! (! x_2 | x_3) | ! x_1 | x_3) = (! x_1 | x_1 | x_1)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 1, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 | ! x_2 | ! x_3 | x_1$$

$$\neg(x_1 \mid \mid \neg(x_1 \mid \mid x_1)) \mid \mid \neg(x_1 \mid \mid x_1)$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 3

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \mid \mid \neg(x_1 \mid \mid x_1)) \equiv (a_0 \mid \mid \neg a_0)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Equationalized Axiom 7, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \rightarrow x_2 \mid \mid x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 4

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \mid \mid \neg(x_1 \mid \mid x_1)) \equiv (a_0 \mid \mid \neg a_0)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 3, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \rightarrow x_2 \mid \mid x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 5

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \mid \mid \neg(x_1 \mid \mid x_1)) \equiv (\neg x_1 \mid \mid x_1 \mid \mid x_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 4, and apply the substitution:

$$a_0 \mid \mid \neg a_0 \rightarrow \neg x_1 \mid \mid x_1 \mid \mid x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 5.

### Substitution Lemma 6

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \mid \mid \neg(x_1 \mid \mid x_1)) \equiv (\neg x_1 \mid \mid x_1 \mid \mid x_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 5, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \rightarrow x_2 \mid \mid x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 7

It can be shown that:

$$\neg(\neg x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \mid \mid \neg(\neg x_2 \mid \mid x_3 \mid \mid \neg x_1 \mid \mid x_3 \rightarrow x_1 \mid \mid \neg(x_1 \mid \mid x_1)))$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 2, and apply the substitution:

$$\neg x_1 \mid \mid x_1 \mid \mid x_1 \rightarrow x_1 \mid \mid \neg(x_1 \mid \mid x_1)$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 6.

### Critical Pair Lemma 2

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid !x1)) == (x1 \&\& x2)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ \&\& x2\_ \mid \mid (x1\_ \&\& x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1\_ \&\& x2\_ \mid \mid (x1\_ \&\& x3\_ ))$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid (x2\_ \&\& !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 8 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 3

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$((x1 \mid \mid !x1) \&\& x2) == x2$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ \&\& x1\_$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \&\& x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ \mid \mid !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 9 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 4

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& x2) == (x1 \&\& (!x1 \mid \mid x2))$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ \&\& !x1\_ ) \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1\_ \&\& !x1\_ ) \mid \mid x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ \&\& x2\_ ) \mid \mid (x1\_ \&\& x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid x3)$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 1 and Equationalized Axiom 8 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 5

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid x2) == (x1 \mid \mid (!x1 \&\& x2))$$



**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ || !x1\_)\&& x2\_ \rightarrow x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1\_ || !x1\_)\&& x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ || x2\_)\&& (x1\_ || x3\_)\rightarrow x1\_ || (x2\&& x3)$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 3 and Equationalized Axiom 4 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 6**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\&&x1) == x1$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&& (!x1\_ || x2\_)\rightarrow x1\&&x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \&& (!x1\_ || x2\_)$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&& (x2\_ || !x2\_)\rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 4 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 7**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\&&(x1\_ || x2\_)) == (x1\&&(a_0 || !a_0))$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&& (!x1\_ || x2\_)\rightarrow x1\&&x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1\_ || x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$"0"$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 4 and Equationalized Axiom 5 respectively.

**Substitution Lemma 8**

It can be shown that:

$$(x1\&&(x1\_ || x2\_)) == x1$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 7, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&& (x2\_ || !x2\_)\rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 2

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 2.

### Critical Pair Lemma 8

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | | x1) == x1$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1\_ | | x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\&x2\_ )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \&\&!x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 5 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 9

The following expressions are equivalent:

**True**

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1\_ | | x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1\_ \&\&x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 5 and Critical Pair Lemma 6 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 9

It can be shown that:

$$!( !x1\_ | | x2\_ ) | | ! ( !x2\_ | | x3\_ ) | | !x1\_ | | x3\_ \rightarrow x1 | | !x1$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 7, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 8.

### Critical Pair Lemma 10

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 == (x1 \&\& (x2 | | x1) )$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

Out[19]=

$$x1\_ || x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ || x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 8 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 11

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& x1) == (x1 \&\& (x1 || !x1))$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ || !x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \&\& x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ || !x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || !x1\_ \rightarrow x1\_ || !x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 2 and Critical Pair Lemma 9 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 10

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& x1) == x1$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 11, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ || !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 2.

## Substitution Lemma 11

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& x1) == x1$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 10, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \&\& x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 9.

## Substitution Lemma 12

It can be shown that:

$$\text{True}$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 11, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 6.

Critical Pair Lemma 10

### Critical Pair Lemma 12

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(!x1 | x2) == (!x1 | (x1 \&\&x2))$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\&x2\_)\rightarrow x1\_ | x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 5 and Substitution Lemma 12 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 13

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& (x2 | x1)) == x1$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 10, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 12.

### Substitution Lemma 14

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& (x1 | x2)) == x1$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 8, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 12.

### Critical Pair Lemma 13

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | | !x1) == (x2 | | x1 | | !x1)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ | | x1\_)\rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ | | x1\_)$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ | | !x1\_)\&\&x2\_ \rightarrow x2$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 13 and Critical Pair Lemma 3 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 14

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(\neg x_1 \mid x_1 \mid x_2) = (\neg x_1 \mid x_1)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$\neg x_1 \mid (x_1 \ \&\& x_2) \rightarrow \neg x_1 \mid x_2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x_1 \ \&\& x_2$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x_1 \ \&\& (x_1 \mid x_2) \rightarrow x_1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 12 and Substitution Lemma 14 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 15

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x_1 \mid \neg x_1) = (\neg(\neg x_1 \mid x_2) \mid \neg x_1 \mid x_1)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$\text{Language`EquationalProofDump`getConstructRule[EquationalProof`ApplyLemma[222, x1_ \mid x1_ \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$\neg(\neg x_2 \mid x_3) \mid \neg x_1 \mid x_3$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x_1 \mid x_2 \mid \neg x_2 \rightarrow x_2 \mid \neg x_2$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 9 and Critical Pair Lemma 13 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 15

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \mid \neg x_1) = (\neg x_1 \mid x_1)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 15, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid x_2 \mid \neg x_2 \rightarrow x_2 \mid \neg x_2$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 13.

## Substitution Lemma 16

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \mid \neg x_1) = (\neg x_1 \mid x_1)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 15, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \rightarrow x_1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 12.

## Substitution Lemma 17

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \mid \mid !x_1) = (x_1 \mid \mid !x_1)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 16, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \rightarrow x_2 \mid \mid x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

## Substitution Lemma 18

It can be shown that:

$$(!x_1 \mid \mid x_1 \mid \mid x_2) = (x_1 \mid \mid !x_1)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 14, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \rightarrow x_2 \mid \mid x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

## Substitution Lemma 19

It can be shown that:

$$(!y_0 \mid \mid y_0 \mid \mid x_1) = (a_0 \mid \mid !a_0)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Equationalized Hypothesis 1, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \rightarrow x_2 \mid \mid x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

## Substitution Lemma 20

It can be shown that:

$$(!y_0 \mid \mid y_0 \mid \mid x_1) = (x_1 \mid \mid !x_1)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 19, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid \mid !x_1 \rightarrow x_1 \mid \mid !x_1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 17.

## Substitution Lemma 21

It can be shown that:

$$(y_0 \mid \mid !y_0) = (x_1 \mid \mid !x_1)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 20, and apply the substitution:

$$!x_1 \mid \mid x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \rightarrow x_1 \mid \mid !x_1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 18.

## Conclusion 1

We obtain the conclusion:

**True**

**PROOF**

Take Substitution Lemma 21, and apply the substitution:


$x_1 \mapsto x_1$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 17.

---

## APPENDIX 2. Proof of CN implies PM2.

In[20]:= proofCNimppm2 ["ProofNotebook"]



### Axiom 1

We are given that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y,z\}} ( (x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow ( (y \Rightarrow z) \Rightarrow (x \Rightarrow z) ) )$$

### Axiom 2

We are given that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y\}} ( x \Rightarrow ( ! x \Rightarrow y ) )$$

### Axiom 3

We are given that:

$$\forall_x ( ( ! x \Rightarrow x ) \Rightarrow x )$$

### Hypothesis 1

We would like to show that:

$$\forall_x ( ( ! x \Rightarrow x ) \Rightarrow x )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 1

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x1 \mid \mid x2) == (x2 \mid \mid x1)$$

### Equationalized Axiom 2

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$( ! x1 \mid \mid x1 \mid \mid x2 ) == ( a_0 \mid \mid ! a_0 )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 3

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$( ! (x1 \mid \mid x1) \mid \mid x1 ) == ( a_0 \mid \mid ! a_0 )$$

### Equationalized Hypothesis 1

We generate the "equationalized" hypothesis:

$$( ! (x_0 \mid \mid x_0) \mid \mid x_0 ) == ( a_0 \mid \mid ! a_0 )$$

### Substitution Lemma 1

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid ! (x1 \mid \mid x1) ) == ( a_0 \mid \mid ! a_0 )$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Equationalized Axiom 3, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$



which follows from Equationalized Axiom 1.

## Substitution Lemma 2

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid ! (x1 \mid x1)) = (a_\theta \mid \mid ! a_\theta)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 1, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 1.

## Substitution Lemma 3

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid ! (x1 \mid x1)) = (! x_\theta \mid x_\theta \mid x_\theta)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 2, and apply the substitution:

$$a_\theta \mid \mid ! a_\theta \rightarrow ! x_\theta \mid x_\theta \mid x_\theta$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 2.

## Substitution Lemma 4

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid ! (x1 \mid x1)) = (! x_\theta \mid x_\theta \mid x_\theta)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 3, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 1.

## Substitution Lemma 5

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x_\theta \mid x_\theta) \mid x_\theta) = (a_\theta \mid \mid ! a_\theta)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Equationalized Hypothesis 1, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 1.

## Substitution Lemma 6

It can be shown that:

$$(x_\theta \mid \mid ! (x_\theta \mid x_\theta)) = (a_\theta \mid \mid ! a_\theta)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 5, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

Out[20]=

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 1.

### Substitution Lemma 7

It can be shown that:

$$(x_\theta \mid \mid \neg (x_\theta \mid \mid x_\theta)) = (\neg x_\theta \mid \mid x_\theta \mid \mid x_\theta)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 6, and apply the substitution:

$$a_\theta \mid \mid \neg a_\theta \rightarrow \neg x_\theta \mid \mid x_\theta \mid \mid x_\theta$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 2.

### Substitution Lemma 8

It can be shown that:

$$(x_\theta \mid \mid \neg (x_\theta \mid \mid x_\theta)) = (\neg x_\theta \mid \mid x_\theta \mid \mid x_\theta)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 7, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 1.

### Conclusion 1

We obtain the conclusion:

**True**

#### PROOF

Take Substitution Lemma 8, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid \neg (x1\_ \mid \mid x1\_ ) \rightarrow \neg x_\theta \mid \mid x_\theta \mid \mid x_\theta$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 4.

## APPENDIX 3. Proof of CN implies PM3.

In[21]:= proofCNimp3 ["ProofNotebook"]



### Axiom 1

We are given that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y,z\}} ( (x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow ( (y \Rightarrow z) \Rightarrow (x \Rightarrow z) ) )$$

### Axiom 2

We are given that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y\}} ( x \Rightarrow ( !x \Rightarrow y ) )$$

### Axiom 3

We are given that:

$$\forall_x ( ( !x \Rightarrow x ) \Rightarrow x )$$

### Hypothesis 1

We would like to show that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y\}} ( ( !x \Rightarrow y ) \Rightarrow ( !y \Rightarrow x ) )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 1

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$x1 == (x1 | | (x2 \&\& !x2) )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 2

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$x1 == (x1 \&\& (x2 | | !x2) )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 3

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x1 | | x2) == (x2 | | x1)$$

### Equationalized Axiom 4

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x1 | | (x2 \&\& x3) ) == ( (x1 | | x2) \&\& (x1 | | x3) )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 5

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$( !x1 | | x1 | | x2 ) == ( a_0 | | !a_0 )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 6

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$( ! ( !x1 | | x2 ) | | ! ( !x2 | | x3 ) | | !x1 | | x3 ) == ( a_0 | | !a_0 )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 7

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(! (x_1 | x_1) | x_1) = (a_\theta | ! a_\theta)$$

### Equationalized Axiom 8

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$((x_1 \&\&x_2) | (x_1 \&\&x_3)) = (x_1 \&\&(x_2 | x_3))$$

### Equationalized Axiom 9

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x_1 \&\&x_2) = (x_2 \&\&x_1)$$

### Equationalized Hypothesis 1

We generate the "equationalized" hypothesis:

$$(! (x_1 | y_\theta) | y_\theta | x_1) = (a_\theta | ! a_\theta)$$

### Critical Pair Lemma 1

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$((x_1 \&\&!x_1) | x_2) = x_2$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x_1\_ | x_2\_ \leftrightarrow x_2\_ | x_1\_$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x_1\_ | x_2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x_1\_ | (x_2\_ \&\&!x_2\_ ) \rightarrow x_1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 3 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 1

It can be shown that:

$$(! (!x_1 | x_2) | ! (!x_2 | x_3) | !x_1 | x_3) = (!x_1 | x_1 | x_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Equationalized Axiom 6, and apply the substitution:

$$a_\theta | ! a_\theta \rightarrow !x_1 | x_1 | x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 5.

### Substitution Lemma 2

It can be shown that:

$$(! (!x_1 | x_2) | ! (!x_2 | x_3) | !x_1 | x_3) = (!x_1 | x_1 | x_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 1, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 | x_2 | x_3 | x_1$$

$$x_1 \_ | | x_2 \_ \rightarrow x_2 | | x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 3

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \_ | | (x_1 \_ | | x_1)) = (a_0 \_ | | a_0)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Equationalized Axiom 7, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \_ | | x_2 \_ \rightarrow x_2 | | x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 4

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \_ | | (x_1 \_ | | x_1)) = (a_0 \_ | | a_0)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 3, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \_ | | x_2 \_ \rightarrow x_2 | | x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 5

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \_ | | (x_1 \_ | | x_1)) = (!x_1 \_ | | x_1 | | x_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 4, and apply the substitution:

$$a_0 \_ | | a_0 \rightarrow !x_1 \_ | | x_1 | | x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 5.

### Substitution Lemma 6

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \_ | | (x_1 \_ | | x_1)) = (!x_1 \_ | | x_1 | | x_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 5, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \_ | | x_2 \_ \rightarrow x_2 | | x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 7

It can be shown that:

$$!( !x_1 \_ | | x_2 \_ ) | | ! ( !x_2 \_ | | x_3 \_ ) | | !x_1 \_ | | x_3 \_ \rightarrow x_1 | | ! (x_1 \_ | | x_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 2, and apply the substitution:

$$!x_1 \_ | | x_1 \_ | | x_1 \rightarrow x_1 \_ | | ! (x_1 \_ | | x_1)$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 6.

### Critical Pair Lemma 2

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid !x1)) == (x1 \&\& x2)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1 \&\& x2 \_ \mid \mid (x1 \&\& x3 \_) \rightarrow x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1 \&\& x2 \_ \mid \mid (x1 \&\& x3 \_)$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \_ \mid \mid (x2 \&\& !x2 \_) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 8 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 3

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$((x1 \mid \mid !x1) \&\& x2) == x2$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\& x2 \_ \leftrightarrow x2 \&\& x1 \_$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 \&\& x2 \_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\& (x2 \_ \mid \mid !x2 \_) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 9 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 4

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& x2) == (x1 \&\& (!x1 \mid \mid x2))$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1 \&\& !x1 \_) \mid \mid x2 \_ \rightarrow x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1 \&\& !x1 \_) \mid \mid x2 \_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$(x1 \&\& x2 \_ \mid \mid (x1 \&\& x3 \_) \rightarrow x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid x3)$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 1 and Equationalized Axiom 8 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 5

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid x2) == (x1 \mid \mid (x1 \&\& x2))$$

`(x1 | x2) == (x1 | (x1 && x2))`

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

`(x1_ | | !x1_) && x2_ → x2`

contains a subpattern of the form:

`(x1_ | | !x1_) && x2_`

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

`(x1_ | | x2_) && (x1_ | | x3_) → x1 | | (x2 && x3)`

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 3 and Equationalized Axiom 4 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 6

The following expressions are equivalent:

`(x1 && x1) == x1`

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

`x1_ && (!x1_ | | x2_) → x1 && x2`

contains a subpattern of the form:

`x1_ && (!x1_ | | x2_)`

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

`x1_ && (x2_ | | !x2_) → x1`

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 4 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 7

The following expressions are equivalent:

`(x1 && (x1 | | x2)) == (x1 && (a_0 | | !a_0))`

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

`x1_ && (!x1_ | | x2_) → x1 && x2`

contains a subpattern of the form:

`!x1_ | | x2_`

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

`"0"`

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 4 and Equationalized Axiom 5 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 8

It can be shown that:

`(x1 && (x1 | | x2)) == x1`

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 7, and apply the substitution:

`x1_ && (x2_ | | !x2_) → x1`

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 2

Out[21]=

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 2.

### Critical Pair Lemma 8

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid | x1) == x1$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \mid | (!x1 \ \&\&x2) \rightarrow x1 \mid | x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 \mid | (!x1 \ \&\&x2)$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \mid | (x2 \ \&\&!x2) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 5 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 9

The following expressions are equivalent:

**True**

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \mid | (!x1 \ \&\&x2) \rightarrow x1 \mid | x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1 \ \&\&x2$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \ \&\&x1 \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 5 and Critical Pair Lemma 6 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 9

It can be shown that:

$$!( !x1 \mid | x2) \mid | ! ( !x2 \mid | x3) \mid | !x1 \mid | x3 \rightarrow x1 \mid | !x1$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 7, and apply the substitution:

$$x1 \mid | x1 \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 8.

### Critical Pair Lemma 10

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 == (x1 \ \&\& (x2 \mid | x1))$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \ \&\& (x1 \mid | x2) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:



$$x1\_ || x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ || x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 8 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 11

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& x1) == (x1 \&\& (x1 || !x1))$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ || !x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \&\& x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ || !x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || !x1\_ \rightarrow x1\_ || !x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 2 and Critical Pair Lemma 9 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 10

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& x1) == x1$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 11, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ || !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 2.

## Substitution Lemma 11

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& x1) == x1$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 10, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \&\& x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 9.

## Substitution Lemma 12

It can be shown that:

$$\text{True}$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 11, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 6.

### Substitution Lemma 13

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid x1)) == x1$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 10, and apply the substitution:

$$x1 \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 12.

### Critical Pair Lemma 12

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid !x1) == (x2 \mid \mid x1 \mid \mid !x1)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\& (x2 \_ \mid \mid x1 \_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 \&\& (x2 \_ \mid \mid x1 \_ )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$(x1 \_ \mid \mid !x1 \_ ) \&\& x2 \_ \rightarrow x2$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 13 and Critical Pair Lemma 3 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 13

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid !x1) == (! (!x1 \mid \mid x2) \mid \mid !x1 \mid \mid x1)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$\text{Language`EquationalProofDump`getConstructRule[EquationalProof`ApplyLemma[222, x1 \_ \mid \mid x1 \_ \rightarrow x1]}$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!( !x2 \_ \mid \mid x3 \_ ) \mid \mid !x1 \_ \mid \mid x3 \_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \_ \mid \mid x2 \_ \mid \mid !x2 \_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid !x2$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 9 and Critical Pair Lemma 12 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 14

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid !x1) == (!x1 \mid \mid x1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 13, and apply the substitution:

$$x1 \_ \mid \mid x2 \_ \mid \mid !x2 \_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid !x2$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 12.

### Substitution Lemma 15

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \mid \mid !x_1) = (!x_1 \mid \mid x_1)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 14, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \rightarrow x_1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 12.

### Substitution Lemma 16

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \mid \mid !x_1) = (x_1 \mid \mid !x_1)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 15, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \rightarrow x_2 \mid \mid x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 17

It can be shown that:

$$(! (y_0 \mid \mid x_1) \mid \mid y_0 \mid \mid x_1) = (a_0 \mid \mid !a_0)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Equationalized Hypothesis 1, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \rightarrow x_2 \mid \mid x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 18

It can be shown that:

$$(y_0 \mid \mid x_1 \mid \mid ! (y_0 \mid \mid x_1)) = (a_0 \mid \mid !a_0)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 17, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \rightarrow x_2 \mid \mid x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 19

It can be shown that:

$$(y_0 \mid \mid x_1 \mid \mid ! (y_0 \mid \mid x_1)) = (x_1 \mid \mid !x_1)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 18, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid \mid !x_1 \rightarrow x_1 \mid \mid x_1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 16.

### Substitution Lemma 20

It can be shown that:

$$(y_0 \mid \mid x_1 \mid \mid ! (y_0 \mid \mid x_1)) = (x_1 \mid \mid ! x_1)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 19, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \rightarrow x_1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 12.

### Substitution Lemma 21

It can be shown that:

$$(y_0 \mid \mid x_1 \mid \mid ! (y_0 \mid \mid x_1)) = (x_1 \mid \mid ! x_1)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 20, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \rightarrow x_1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 12.

### Conclusion 1

We obtain the conclusion:

**True**

**PROOF**

Take Substitution Lemma 21, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid \mid ! x_1 \rightarrow x_1 \mid \mid ! x_1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 16.

## APPENDIX 4. Proof of CN implies PM4.

In[22]:= proofCNimppm4 ["ProofNotebook"]

**Axiom 1**

We are given that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y,z\}} ((x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow ((y \Rightarrow z) \Rightarrow (x \Rightarrow z)))$$

**Axiom 2**

We are given that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y\}} (x \Rightarrow (\neg x \Rightarrow y))$$

**Axiom 3**

We are given that:

$$\forall_x ((\neg x \Rightarrow x) \Rightarrow x)$$

**Hypothesis 1**

We would like to show that:

$$\forall_{\{x\}} ((y \Rightarrow z) \Rightarrow ((\neg x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow (\neg x \Rightarrow z)))$$

**Equationalized Axiom 1**

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$x1 == (x1 | | (x2 \&\& \neg x2))$$

**Equationalized Axiom 2**

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$x1 == (x1 \&\& (x2 | | \neg x2))$$

**Equationalized Axiom 3**

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x1 | | x2) == (x2 | | x1)$$

**Equationalized Axiom 4**

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x1 | | (x2 \&\& x3)) == ((x1 | | x2) \&\& (x1 | | x3))$$

**Equationalized Axiom 5**

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(\neg x1 | | x1 | | x2) == (\neg a_0 | | \neg a_0)$$

**Equationalized Axiom 6**

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(! ( !x1 | x2 ) | ! ( !x2 | x3 ) | !x1 | x3) == (a_0 | !a_0)$$

### Equationalized Axiom 7

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(! (x1 | x1) | x1) == (a_0 | !a_0)$$

### Equationalized Axiom 8

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$((x1 \&\&x2) | (x1 \&\&x3)) == (x1 \&\&(x2 | x3))$$

### Equationalized Axiom 9

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x1 \&\&x2) == (x2 \&\&x1)$$

### Equationalized Hypothesis 1

We generate the "equationalized" hypothesis:

$$(! ( !y | z ) | ! (x_0 | y) | x_0 | z) == (a_0 | !a_0)$$

### Critical Pair Lemma 1

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$((x1 \&\&!x1) | x2) == x2$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ | x1\_$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ | x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | (x2\_ \&\&!x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 3 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 2

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | (x2 \&\&!x1)) == (x1 | x2)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ | x2\_ ) \&\& (x1\_ | x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | (x2 \&\&x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1\_ | x2\_ ) \&\& (x1\_ | x3\_ )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ | !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 3

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& x3)) == ((x2 \mid \mid x1) \&\& (x1 \mid \mid x3))$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ ) \&\& (x1\_ \mid \mid x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ \mid \mid x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 1

It can be shown that:

$$(! \mid (! x1 \mid \mid x2) \mid \mid ! \mid (! x2 \mid \mid x3) \mid \mid ! x1 \mid \mid x3) == (! x_{\theta} \mid \mid x_{\theta} \mid \mid x_{\theta})$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Equationalized Axiom 6, and apply the substitution:

$$a_{\theta} \mid \mid ! a_{\theta} \rightarrow ! x_{\theta} \mid \mid x_{\theta} \mid \mid x_{\theta}$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 5.

## Substitution Lemma 2

It can be shown that:

$$(! \mid (! x1 \mid \mid x2) \mid \mid ! \mid (! x2 \mid \mid x3) \mid \mid ! x1 \mid \mid x3) == (! x_{\theta} \mid \mid x_{\theta} \mid \mid x_{\theta})$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 1, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

## Substitution Lemma 3

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid ! (x1 \mid \mid x1)) == (a_{\theta} \mid \mid ! a_{\theta})$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Equationalized Axiom 7, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

## Substitution Lemma 4

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid ! (x1 \mid \mid x1)) == (a_{\theta} \mid \mid ! a_{\theta})$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 3, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 5

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 | | ! (x1 | | x1) ) = ( ! x_0 | | x_0 | | x_0 )$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 4, and apply the substitution:

$$a_0 | | ! a_0 \rightarrow ! x_0 | | x_0 | | x_0$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 5.

### Substitution Lemma 6

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 | | ! (x1 | | x1) ) = ( ! x_0 | | x_0 | | x_0 )$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 5, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 7

It can be shown that:

$$! ( ! x1\_ | | x2\_ ) | | ! ( ! x2\_ | | x3\_ ) | | ! x1\_ | | x3\_ \rightarrow x_0 | | ! ( x_0 | | x_0 )$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 2, and apply the substitution:

$$! x_0 | | x_0 | | x_0 \rightarrow x_0 | | ! ( x_0 | | x_0 )$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 6.

### Critical Pair Lemma 4

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& (x2 | | ! x1) ) = (x1 \&\& x2)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) | | (x1\_ \&\&x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \&\& (x2 | | x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) | | (x1\_ \&\&x3\_ )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \&\&!x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 8 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 5

The following expressions are equivalent:



The following expressions are equivalent:

$$((x1 \mid \mid !x1) \&\&x2) == x2$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\&x2 \leftrightarrow x2 \&\&x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 \&\&x2$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\&(x2 \mid \mid !x2) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 9 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 6

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\&x2) == (x1 \&\&(!x1 \mid \mid x2))$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1 \&\&!x1) \mid \mid x2 \rightarrow x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1 \&\&!x1) \mid \mid x2$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$(x1 \&\&x2) \mid \mid (x1 \&\&x3) \rightarrow x1 \&\&(x2 \mid \mid x3)$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 1 and Equationalized Axiom 8 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 7

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid x2) == (x1 \mid \mid (!x1 \&\&x2))$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1 \mid \mid !x1) \&\&x2 \rightarrow x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1 \mid \mid !x1) \&\&x2$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$(x1 \mid \mid x2) \&\&(x1 \mid \mid x3) \rightarrow x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\&x3)$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 5 and Equationalized Axiom 4 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 8

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid x1) == x1$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\&!x1) \rightarrow x1 \mid \mid x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ || (x2\_ \&\&!x1\_)$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || (x2\_ \&\&!x2\_)\rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 2 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 9

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\_ || (x2\_ \&\&x1)) == (x1\_ || x2) \&\&x1$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ || x2) \&\&(x1\_ || x3) \rightarrow x1\_ || (x2\_ \&\&x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ || x3\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Critical Pair Lemma 8 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 8

It can be shown that:

$$(x1\_ || (x2\_ \&\&x1)) == (x1\_ \&\&(x1\_ || x2))$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 9, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\&x2\_ \rightarrow x2\_ \&\&x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 9.

### Critical Pair Lemma 10

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\_ \&\&x1) == x1$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&(!x1\_ || x2) \rightarrow x1\_ \&\&x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \&\&(!x1\_ || x2)$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&(x2\_ || !x2) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 6 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 11

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\_ \&\&(x1\_ || x2)) == (x1\_ \&\&(x1\_ || x1))$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (!x1\_ | |x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1\&\&x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1\_ | |x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$"0"$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 6 and Equationalized Axiom 5 respectively.

**Substitution Lemma 9**

It can be shown that:

$$(x1\&\&(x1 | |x2) ) == x1$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 11, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ | | !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 2.

**Critical Pair Lemma 12**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | |x1) == x1$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | |x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\&x2\_ )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \&\&!x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 7 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 13**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$\text{True}$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | |x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1\_ \&\&x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 7 and Critical Pair Lemma 10 respectively.

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 7 and Critical Pair Lemma 10 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 10

It can be shown that:

$$!( !x1\_ || x2\_ ) || ! ( !x2\_ || x3\_ ) || !x1\_ || x3\_ \rightarrow x_0 || !x_0$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 7, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ || x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 12.

### Critical Pair Lemma 14

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 == (x1 \&\& (x2 || x1) )$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x1\_ || x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ || x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ || x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 9 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 15

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& x1) == (x1 \&\& (x1 || !x1) )$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ || !x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \&\& x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ || !x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || !x1\_ \rightarrow x1 || !x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 4 and Critical Pair Lemma 13 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 11

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& x1) == x1$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 15, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ || !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 2.

Out[22]=

## Substitution Lemma 12

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& x1) == x1$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 11, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \&\& x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 9.

## Substitution Lemma 13

It can be shown that:

**True**

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 12, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 10.

## Substitution Lemma 14

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& (x2 | | x1) ) == x1$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 14, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 13.

## Substitution Lemma 15

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& (x1 | | x2) ) == x1$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 9, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 13.

## Critical Pair Lemma 16

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | | !x1) == (x2 | | x1 | | !x1)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ | | x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ | | x1\_ )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ | | !x1\_ ) \&\&x2\_ \rightarrow x2$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 14 and Critical Pair Lemma 5 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 16

It can be shown that:

$$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \&\&x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 8, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\&(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 15.

## Critical Pair Lemma 17

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | | x2) == (x1 | | x2 | | x1)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$\text{Language`EquationalProofDump`getConstructRule[EquationalProof`ApplyLemma[412, x1\_ \&\&(x1\_ | |$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ \&\&x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 16 and Substitution Lemma 15 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 17

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 | | x2) == (x1 | | x1 | | x2)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 17, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

## Critical Pair Lemma 18

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | | ( (x1 | | x2) \&\&x3 ) ) == ( (x1 | | x2) \&\&(x1 | | x3) )$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \&\&(x1\_ | | x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | | (x2\&\&x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || x1\_ || x2\_ \rightarrow x1\_ || x2$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Substitution Lemma 17 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 18

It can be shown that:

$$(x1\_ || ((x1\_ || x2) \&\&x3)) = (x1\_ || (x2\&\&x3))$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 18, and apply the substitution:

$$(x1\_ || x2) \&\& (x1\_ || x3) \rightarrow x1\_ || (x2\&\&x3)$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 4.

### Critical Pair Lemma 19

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x_{\theta} || !x_{\theta}) = (!x1\_ || x2) || !x1\_ || x1$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$\text{Language`EquationalProofDump`getConstructRule[EquationalProof`ApplyLemma[222, x1\_ || x1\_ \rightarrow x1}$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!(x2\_ || x3) || !x1\_ || x3$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || x2\_ || !x2\_ \rightarrow x2\_ || !x2$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 10 and Critical Pair Lemma 16 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 19

It can be shown that:

$$(x_{\theta} || !x_{\theta}) = (!x1\_ || x1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 19, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ || x2\_ || !x2\_ \rightarrow x2\_ || !x2$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 16.

### Substitution Lemma 20

It can be shown that:

$$(x_{\theta} || !x_{\theta}) = (!x1\_ || x1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 19, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 13.

### Substitution Lemma 21

It can be shown that:

It can be shown that:

$$(x_0 \mid \mid !x_0) = (x_1 \mid \mid !x_1)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 20, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Critical Pair Lemma 20

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid x3))) = (x1 \mid \mid x2 \mid \mid (x1 \&\& x3))$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid ((x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ ) \&\& x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ ) \&\& x3\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ ) \&\& (x2\_ \mid \mid x3\_ ) \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid (x1 \&\& x3)$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 18 and Critical Pair Lemma 3 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 22

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid x2) = (x1 \mid \mid x2 \mid \mid (x1 \&\& x3))$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 20, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 15.

### Critical Pair Lemma 21

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid x2) = (x1 \mid \mid (x1 \&\& x3) \mid \mid x2)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \mid \mid (x1\_ \&\& x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \mid \mid x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ \mid \mid (x1\_ \&\& x3\_ )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ \mid \mid x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 22 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 22

The following expressions are equivalent:



$$(x1 | x2) = (x1 | x2 | (x3 \&\&x1))$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | x2\_ | (x1\_ \&\&x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \&\&x3\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ \&\&x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 22 and Equationalized Axiom 9 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 23

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | x2) = (x1 | (x3 \&\&x1) | x2)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) | | x3\_ \rightarrow x1 | x3$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \&\&x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ \&\&x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 21 and Equationalized Axiom 9 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 24

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | x2 | x3) = (x1 | x2 | x3 | x1)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | (x3\_ \&\&x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x3\_ \&\&x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 22 and Substitution Lemma 15 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 25

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | x2 | x3) = (x1 | x2 | x2 | x3)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \&\&x1\_ ) | | x3\_ \rightarrow x1 | x3$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$x2\_ \&\&x1\_$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1\_ \&\&(x2\_ | |x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 23 and Substitution Lemma 14 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 26

The following expressions are equivalent:

$(x1 | |x2 | |x3) = (x3 | |x1 | |x1 | |x2)$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | |x2\_ | |x3\_ | |x1\_ \rightarrow x1 | |x2 | |x3$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$x1\_ | |x2\_ | |x3\_ | |x1\_$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | |x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ | |x1\_$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 24 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 23

It can be shown that:

$(x1 | |x2 | |x3) = (x3 | |x1 | |x2)$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 26, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ | |x2\_ | |x2\_ | |x3\_ \rightarrow x1 | |x2 | |x3$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 25.

### Substitution Lemma 24

It can be shown that:

$(!(y | |z) | |x_0 | |z | |!(x_0 | |y)) = (a_0 | |!a_0)$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Equationalized Hypothesis 1, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ | |x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | |x1$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 25

It can be shown that:

$(x_0 | |z | |!(x_0 | |y) | |!(y | |z)) = (a_0 | |!a_0)$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 24, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ | |x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | |x1$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 26

It can be shown that:

$$(x_0 \mid \mid z \mid \mid ! (x_0 \mid \mid y) \mid \mid ! (! y \mid \mid z)) == (x_0 \mid \mid ! x_0)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 25, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid ! x1\_ \rightarrow x_0 \mid \mid ! x_0$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 21.

### Substitution Lemma 27

It can be shown that:

$$(! (! y \mid \mid z) \mid \mid x_0 \mid \mid z \mid \mid ! (x_0 \mid \mid y)) == (x_0 \mid \mid ! x_0)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 26, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \mid \mid x3\_ \rightarrow x3 \mid \mid x1 \mid \mid x2$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 23.

### Substitution Lemma 28

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x_0 \mid \mid y) \mid \mid ! (! y \mid \mid z) \mid \mid x_0 \mid \mid z) == (x_0 \mid \mid ! x_0)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 27, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Conclusion 1

We obtain the conclusion:

**True**

#### PROOF

Take Substitution Lemma 28, and apply the substitution:

$$! (! x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ ) \mid \mid ! (! x2\_ \mid \mid x3\_ ) \mid \mid ! x1\_ \mid \mid x3\_ \rightarrow x_0 \mid \mid ! x_0$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 10.

## APPENDIX 5. Proof of CN implies PM5.

In[23]:= proofCNimp5 ["ProofNotebook"]



### Axiom 1

We are given that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y,z\}} ((x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow ((y \Rightarrow z) \Rightarrow (x \Rightarrow z)))$$

### Axiom 2

We are given that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y\}} (x \Rightarrow (\neg x \Rightarrow y))$$

### Axiom 3

We are given that:

$$\forall_x ((\neg x \Rightarrow x) \Rightarrow x)$$

### Hypothesis 1

We would like to show that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y,z\}} ((\neg x \Rightarrow (\neg y \Rightarrow z)) \Rightarrow (\neg y \Rightarrow (\neg x \Rightarrow z)))$$

### Equationalized Axiom 1

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$x1 = (x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& \neg x2))$$

### Equationalized Axiom 2

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$x1 = (x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid \neg x2))$$

### Equationalized Axiom 3

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x1 \mid \mid x2) = (x2 \mid \mid x1)$$

### Equationalized Axiom 4

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& x3)) = ((x1 \mid \mid x2) \&\& (x1 \mid \mid x3))$$

### Equationalized Axiom 5

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(\neg x1 \mid \mid x1 \mid \mid x2) = (a_0 \mid \mid \neg a_0)$$

### Equationalized Axiom 6

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(\neg (\neg x1 \mid \mid x2) \mid \mid \neg (\neg x2 \mid \mid x3) \mid \mid \neg x1 \mid \mid x3) = (a_0 \mid \mid \neg a_0)$$

## Equationalized Axiom 7

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(! (x1 | | x1) | | x1) == (a_0 | | ! a_0)$$

## Equationalized Axiom 8

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$((x1 \&\& x2) | | (x1 \&\& x3)) == (x1 \&\& (x2 | | x3))$$

## Equationalized Axiom 9

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x1 \&\& x2) == (x2 \&\& x1)$$

## Equationalized Hypothesis 1

We generate the "equationalized" hypothesis:

$$(! (x2 | | y1 | | z_0) | | y1 | | x2 | | z_0) == (a_0 | | ! a_0)$$

## Critical Pair Lemma 1

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$((x1 \&\& ! x1) | | x2) == x2$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ | | x1\_$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \&\& ! x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 3 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 2

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | | (x2 \&\& ! x1)) == (x1 | | x2)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \&\& (x1\_ | | x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | | (x2 \&\& x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \&\& (x1\_ | | x3\_ )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ | | ! x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 3

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& x3)) = ( (x2 \mid \mid x1) \&\& (x1 \mid \mid x3) )$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ ) \&\& (x1\_ \mid \mid x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ \mid \mid x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

**Substitution Lemma 1**

It can be shown that:

$$(! ( ! x1 \mid \mid x2 ) \mid \mid ! ( ! x2 \mid \mid x3 ) \mid \mid ! x1 \mid \mid x3) = ( ! y1 \mid \mid y1 \mid \mid y1 )$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Equationalized Axiom 6, and apply the substitution:

$$a_0 \mid \mid ! a_0 \rightarrow ! y1 \mid \mid y1 \mid \mid y1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 5.

**Substitution Lemma 2**

It can be shown that:

$$(! ( ! x1 \mid \mid x2 ) \mid \mid ! ( ! x2 \mid \mid x3 ) \mid \mid ! x1 \mid \mid x3) = ( ! y1 \mid \mid y1 \mid \mid y1 )$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 1, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

**Substitution Lemma 3**

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid ! (x1 \mid \mid x1)) = (a_0 \mid \mid ! a_0)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Equationalized Axiom 7, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

**Substitution Lemma 4**

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid ! (x1 \mid \mid x1)) = (a_0 \mid \mid ! a_0)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 3, and apply the substitution:

$$x1 \mid \mid x2 \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 5

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid \neg(x1 \mid \mid x1)) = (\neg y1 \mid \mid y1 \mid \mid y1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 4, and apply the substitution:

$$a_0 \mid \mid \neg a_0 \rightarrow \neg y1 \mid \mid y1 \mid \mid y1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 5.

### Substitution Lemma 6

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid \neg(x1 \mid \mid x1)) = (\neg y1 \mid \mid y1 \mid \mid y1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 5, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 7

It can be shown that:

$$\neg(\neg x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ ) \mid \mid \neg(\neg x2\_ \mid \mid x3\_ ) \mid \mid \neg x1\_ \mid \mid x3\_ \rightarrow y1 \mid \mid \neg(y1 \mid \mid y1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 2, and apply the substitution:

$$\neg y1 \mid \mid y1 \mid \mid y1 \rightarrow y1 \mid \mid \neg(y1 \mid \mid y1)$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 6.

### Critical Pair Lemma 4

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid \neg x1)) = (x1 \&\& x2)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ \&\& x2\_ ) \mid \mid (x1\_ \&\& x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1\_ \&\& x2\_ ) \mid \mid (x1\_ \&\& x3\_ )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid (x2\_ \&\& \neg x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 8 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 5

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$\neg(\neg x1 \mid \mid \neg x1 \&\& x2) = x2$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ \&\&x1\_$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \&\&x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&(x2\_ | | !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 9 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 6**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\&\&x2) == (x1\&\&( !x1 | | x2 ) )$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ \&\&!x1\_ ) | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1\_ \&\&!x1\_ ) | | x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) | | (x1\_ \&\&x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1\&\&(x2 | | x3)$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 1 and Equationalized Axiom 8 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 7**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | | x2) == (x1 | | ( !x1\&\&x2 ) )$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ | | !x1\_ ) \&\&x2\_ \rightarrow x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1\_ | | !x1\_ ) \&\&x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \&\&(x1\_ | | x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | | (x2\&\&x3)$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 5 and Equationalized Axiom 4 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 8**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | | !x1) == (x2 | | !x2)$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ | | !x1\_ ) \&\&x2\_ \rightarrow x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:



contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1\_ || !x1\_ ) \&\&x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&(x2\_ || !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 5 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 9

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | | x1) == x1$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || (x2\_ \&\&!x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | | x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ || (x2\_ \&\&!x1\_ )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || (x2\_ \&\&!x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 2 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 10

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | | (x2\&\&x1) ) == ( (x1 | | x2) \&\&x1 )$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ || | x2\_ ) \&\& (x1\_ || | x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | | (x2\&\&x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ || | x3\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || | x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Critical Pair Lemma 9 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 8

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 | | (x2\&\&x1) ) == (x1\&\& (x1 | | x2) )$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 10, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\&x2\_ \rightarrow x2\&\&x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 9.

### Critical Pair Lemma 11

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\&\&x1) == x1$$

Proof

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (!x1\_ | |x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1\&\&x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \&\& (!x1\_ | |x2\_ )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ | | !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 6 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 12**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\&\&(x1 | |x2)) == (x1\&\&(a_\theta | | !a_\theta))$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (!x1\_ | |x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1\&\&x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1\_ | |x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$"0"$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 6 and Equationalized Axiom 5 respectively.

**Substitution Lemma 9**

It can be shown that:

$$(x1\&\&(x1 | |x2)) == x1$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 12, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ | | !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 2.

**Critical Pair Lemma 13**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | |x1) == x1$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | |x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\&x2\_ )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \&\&!x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 7 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 14

The following expressions are equivalent:

**True**

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || (!x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1\_ || x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1\_ \&\&x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 7 and Critical Pair Lemma 11 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 10

It can be shown that:

$$!( !x1\_ || x2\_ ) || ! ( !x2\_ || x3\_ ) || !x1\_ || x3\_ \rightarrow y1\_ || !y1$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 7, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ || x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 13.

## Critical Pair Lemma 15

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 = (x1 \&\& (x2\_ || x1))$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x1\_ || x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ || x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ || x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 9 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 16

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& x1) = (x1 \&\& (x1\_ || !x1))$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ || !x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \&\& x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ || !x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || !x1\_ \rightarrow x1\_ || !x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 4 and Critical Pair Lemma 14 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 11

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& x1) == x1$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 16, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ || !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 2.

### Substitution Lemma 12

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& x1) == x1$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 11, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \&\& x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 9.

### Substitution Lemma 13

It can be shown that:

**True**

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 12, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 11.

### Substitution Lemma 14

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& (x2 | | x1) ) == x1$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 15, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 13.

### Substitution Lemma 15

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& (x1 | | x2) ) == x1$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 9, and apply the substitution:

`x1_→x1`

which follows from Substitution Lemma 13.

## Critical Pair Lemma 17

The following expressions are equivalent:

`(x1 | | !x1) == (x2 | | x1 | | !x1)`

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

`x1_ && (x2_ | | x1_) → x1`

contains a subpattern of the form:

`x1_ && (x2_ | | x1_)`

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

`(x1_ | | !x1_) && x2_ → x2`

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 14 and Critical Pair Lemma 5 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 16

It can be shown that:

`x1_ | | (x2_ && x1_) → x1`

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 8, and apply the substitution:

`x1_ && (x1_ | | x2_) → x1`

which follows from Substitution Lemma 15.

## Critical Pair Lemma 18

The following expressions are equivalent:

`(x1 | | x2) == (x1 | | x2 | | x1)`

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

`Language`EquationalProofDump`getConstructRule[EquationalProof`ApplyLemma[412,x1_ && (x1_ | |`

contains a subpattern of the form:

`x2_ && x1_`

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

`x1_ && (x1_ | | x2_) → x1`

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 16 and Substitution Lemma 15 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 17

It can be shown that:

`(x1 | | x2) == (x1 | | x1 | | x2)`

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 18, and apply the substitution:

Out[23]=

$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Critical Pair Lemma 19

The following expressions are equivalent:

$(x1\_ | | (x1\_ | | x2) \&\&x3) = (x1\_ | | x2) \&\&(x1\_ | | x3)$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \&\&(x1\_ | | x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1\_ | | (x2\&\&x3)$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$x1\_ | | x2\_$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x1\_ | | x2$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Substitution Lemma 17 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 18

It can be shown that:

$(x1\_ | | (x1\_ | | x2) \&\&x3) = (x1\_ | | (x2\&\&x3))$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 19, and apply the substitution:

$(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \&\&(x1\_ | | x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1\_ | | (x2\&\&x3)$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 4.

### Critical Pair Lemma 20

The following expressions are equivalent:

$(y1\_ | | !y1) = (!x1\_ | | x2) | | !x1\_ | | x1$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

`Language`EquationalProofDump`getConstructRule[EquationalProof`ApplyLemma[222,x1\_ | | x1_→x1`

contains a subpattern of the form:

$!(x2\_ | | x3\_ ) | | !x1\_ | | x3\_$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | !x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | !x2$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 10 and Critical Pair Lemma 17 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 19

It can be shown that:

$(y1\_ | | !y1) = (!x1\_ | | x1)$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 20, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | !x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | !x2$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 17.

### Substitution Lemma 20

It can be shown that:

$$(y_1 \mid \mid !y_1) = (!x_1 \mid \mid x_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 19, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \rightarrow x_1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 13.

### Substitution Lemma 21

It can be shown that:

$$(y_1 \mid \mid !y_1) = (x_1 \mid \mid !x_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 20, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \rightarrow x_2 \mid \mid x_1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Critical Pair Lemma 21

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x_1 \mid \mid (x_2 \&\& (x_2 \mid \mid x_3))) = (x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \mid \mid (x_1 \&\& x_3))$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x_1 \mid \mid ((x_1 \mid \mid x_2) \&\& x_3) \rightarrow x_1 \mid \mid (x_2 \&\& x_3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x_1 \mid \mid x_2) \&\& x_3$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$(x_1 \mid \mid x_2) \&\& (x_2 \mid \mid x_3) \rightarrow x_2 \mid \mid (x_1 \&\& x_3)$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 18 and Critical Pair Lemma 3 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 22

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 \mid \mid x_2) = (x_1 \mid \mid x_2 \mid \mid (x_1 \&\& x_3))$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 21, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1 \&\& (x_1 \mid \mid x_2) \rightarrow x_1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 15.

### Critical Pair Lemma 22

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x_1 \mid \mid x_2) = (x_1 \mid \mid (x_1 \&\& x_3) \mid \mid x_2)$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | (x1\_ \&\&x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1\_ | | x2\_$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ | | (x1\_ \&\&x3\_ )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ | | x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 22 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 23**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) == (x1\_ | | x2\_ | | (x3\_ \&\&x1\_ ) )$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | (x1\_ \&\&x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1\_ | | x2\_$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \&\&x3\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ \&\&x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 22 and Equationalized Axiom 9 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 24**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) == (x1\_ | | (x3\_ \&\&x1\_ ) | | x2\_ )$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) | | x3\_ \rightarrow x1\_ | | x3\_$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \&\&x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ \&\&x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 22 and Equationalized Axiom 9 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 25**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\_ | | x2\_ | | x3\_ ) == (x1\_ | | x2\_ | | x3\_ | | x1\_ )$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | (x3\_ \&\&x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1\_ | | x2\_$$

contains a subpattern of the form:



$$x3 \ \&\&x1 \_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \ \&\&(x1 \_ \mid x2 \_) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 23 and Substitution Lemma 15 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 26

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid x2 \mid x3) = (x1 \mid x2 \mid x2 \mid x3)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \_ \mid (x2 \ \&\&x1 \_) \mid x3 \rightarrow x1 \mid x3$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2 \ \&\&x1 \_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \ \&\&(x2 \_ \mid x1 \_) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 24 and Substitution Lemma 14 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 27

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid x2 \mid x3) = (x3 \mid x1 \mid x1 \mid x2)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \_ \mid x2 \_ \mid x3 \_ \mid x1 \rightarrow x1 \mid x2 \mid x3$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 \_ \mid x2 \_ \mid x3 \_ \mid x1 \_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \_ \mid x2 \_ \leftrightarrow x2 \_ \mid x1 \_$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 25 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 23

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid x2 \mid x3) = (x3 \mid x1 \mid x2)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 27, and apply the substitution:

$$x1 \_ \mid x2 \_ \mid x2 \_ \mid x3 \rightarrow x1 \mid x2 \mid x3$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 26.

### Substitution Lemma 24

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x2 \mid y1 \mid z0) \mid y1 \mid z0 \mid x2) = (a0 \mid ! a0)$$

#### PROOF

**PROOF**

We start by taking Equationalized Hypothesis 1, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 25

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x2 | | y1 | | z0) | | z0 | | x2 | | y1) == (a0 | | ! a0)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 24, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 26

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x2 | | z0 | | y1) | | z0 | | x2 | | y1) == (a0 | | ! a0)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 25, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 27

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x2 | | z0 | | y1) | | z0 | | x2 | | y1) == (y1 | | ! y1)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 26, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | ! x1\_ \rightarrow y1 | | ! y1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 21.

### Substitution Lemma 28

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x2 | | z0 | | y1) | | z0 | | x2 | | y1) == (y1 | | ! y1)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 27, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 13.

### Substitution Lemma 29

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x2 | | z0 | | y1) | | z0 | | x2 | | y1) == (y1 | | ! y1)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 28, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 13.

### Substitution Lemma 30

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x_2 | z_0 | y_1) | | y_1 | | z_0 | | x_2) == (y_1 | | ! y_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 29, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | x3\_ \rightarrow x3 | | x1 | | x2$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 23.

### Substitution Lemma 31

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x_2 | z_0 | y_1) | | z_0 | | y_1 | | x_2) == (y_1 | | ! y_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 30, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 32

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x_2 | z_0 | y_1) | | x_2 | | z_0 | | y_1) == (y_1 | | ! y_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 31, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 33

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x_2 | y_1 | z_0) | | x_2 | | z_0 | | y_1) == (y_1 | | ! y_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 32, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 34

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x_2 | y_1 | z_0) | | x_2 | | y_1 | | z_0) == (y_1 | | ! y_1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 33, and apply the substitution:

we start by taking Substitution Lemma 35, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | |x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | |x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 35

It can be shown that:

$$(! (y1 | |z0 | |x2 | | |x2 | |y1 | |z0) == (y1 | |!y1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 34, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | |x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | |x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 36

It can be shown that:

$$(! (z0 | |y1 | |x2 | | |x2 | |y1 | |z0) == (y1 | |!y1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 35, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | |x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | |x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 37

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x2 | |z0 | |y1 | | |x2 | |y1 | |z0) == (y1 | |!y1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 36, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | |x2\_ | |x3\_ \rightarrow x3 | |x1 | |x2$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 23.

### Substitution Lemma 38

It can be shown that:

$$(! (y1 | |x2 | |z0 | | |x2 | |y1 | |z0) == (y1 | |!y1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 37, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | |x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | |x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 39

It can be shown that:

$$(! (y1 | |z0 | |x2 | | |x2 | |y1 | |z0) == (y1 | |!y1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 38, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 40

It can be shown that:

$$(x2\_ | | y1 | | z0 | | ! (y1 | | z0 | | x2) ) = (y1 | | ! y1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 39, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 41

It can be shown that:

$$(x2\_ | | y1 | | z0 | | ! (y1 | | z0 | | x2) ) = (y1 | | ! y1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 40, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 13.

### Substitution Lemma 42

It can be shown that:

$$(x2\_ | | y1 | | z0 | | ! (z0 | | x2 | | y1) ) = (y1 | | ! y1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 41, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 43

It can be shown that:

$$(x2\_ | | y1 | | z0 | | ! (z0 | | x2 | | y1) ) = (y1 | | ! y1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 42, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 13.

### Substitution Lemma 44

It can be shown that:

$$(x2\_ | | y1 | | z0 | | ! (y1 | | z0 | | x2) ) = (y1 | | ! y1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 43, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | x3\_ \rightarrow x3 | | x1 | | x2$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 23.

### Substitution Lemma 45

It can be shown that:

$$\langle x_2 \mid y_1 \mid z_0 \mid \neg (x_2 \mid y_1 \mid z_0) \rangle = \langle y_1 \mid \neg y_1 \rangle$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 44, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Conclusion 1

We obtain the conclusion:

**True**

#### PROOF


Take Substitution Lemma 45, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \neg x1\_ \rightarrow y_1 \mid \neg y_1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 8.

## APPENDIX 6. Proof of PM implies CN1.

In[24]:= proofPMimpCN1 ["ProofNotebook"]



### Axiom 1

We are given that:

**PMAxioms**

### Hypothesis 1

We would like to show that:

$$\forall_{\{x,y,z\}} ( (x \Rightarrow y) \Rightarrow ( (y \Rightarrow z) \Rightarrow (x \Rightarrow z) ) )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 1

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$x1 == (x1 | | (x2 \&\& !x2) )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 2

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$x1 == (x1 \&\& (x2 | | !x2) )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 3

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x1 | | x2) == (x2 | | x1)$$

### Equationalized Axiom 4

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x1 | | (x2 \&\& x3) ) == ( (x1 | | x2) \&\& (x1 | | x3) )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 5

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$( (x1 \&\& x2) | | (x1 \&\& x3) ) == (x1 \&\& (x2 | | x3) )$$

### Equationalized Axiom 6

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(a_0 | | !a_0) == \text{PMAxioms}$$

### Equationalized Axiom 7

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$$(x1 \&\& x2) == (x2 \&\& x1)$$

### Equationalized Hypothesis 1

We generate the "equationalized" hypothesis:

$$( ! ( !x_2 | | y_1) | | ! ( !y_1 | | z_0) | | !x_2 | | z_0 ) == (a_0 | | !a_0)$$

### Critical Pair Lemma 1

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\&x3)) = ( (x2 \mid \mid x1) \&\& (x1 \mid \mid x3) )$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ ) \&\& (x1\_ \mid \mid x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\&x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ \mid \mid x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 2

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 = (x1 \&\& PMAxioms)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ \mid \mid !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ \mid \mid !x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$a_0 \mid \mid !a_0 \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 2 and Equationalized Axiom 6 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 3

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 = (PMAxioms \&\& x1)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \&\& PMAxioms$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ \&\& x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 2 and Equationalized Axiom 7 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 4

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& (PMAxioms \mid \mid x2)) = (x1 \mid \mid (x1 \&\& x2))$$

#### PROOF



Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1 \ \&\&x2 \_) \ || \ (x1 \ \&\&x3 \_) \rightarrow x1 \ \&\& \ (x2 \ | \ |x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 \ \&\&x2 \_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \ \&\&PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 5 and Critical Pair Lemma 2 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 5

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \ | \ | \ !x1) == PMAxioms$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$PMAxioms \ \&\&x1 \_ \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$PMAxioms \ \&\&x1 \_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \ \&\& \ (x2 \_ \ | \ | \ !x2 \_) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 3 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 6

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 == (x1 \ | \ | \ !PMAxioms)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \_ \ | \ | \ (x2 \ \&\&!x2 \_) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2 \ \&\&!x2 \_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$PMAxioms \ \&\&x1 \_ \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 1 and Critical Pair Lemma 3 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 7

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \ | \ | \ (!x1 \ \&\&x2)) == (PMAxioms \ \&\& \ (x1 \ | \ | \ x2))$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1 \_ \ | \ | \ x2 \_) \ \&\& \ (x1 \_ \ | \ | \ x3 \_) \rightarrow x1 \ | \ | \ (x2 \ \&\&x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 \_ \ | \ | \ x2 \_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | !x1\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Critical Pair Lemma 5 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 1

It can be shown that:

$$(x1\_ | | (!x1\&\&x2)) = (x1\_ | | x2)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 7, and apply the substitution:

$$PMAxioms\&\&x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 3.

### Critical Pair Lemma 8

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 = (!PMAxioms | | x1)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | !PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ | | !PMAxioms$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ | | x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 6 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 9

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\&\&!x1) = !PMAxioms$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$!PMAxioms | | x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!PMAxioms | | x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \&\&!x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 8 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 10

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\&\&(!x1 | | x2)) = (!PMAxioms | | (x1\&\&x2))$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1 \ \&\&x2) \ || \ (x1 \ \&\&x3) \ \rightarrow \ x1 \ \&\& \ (x2 \ || \ x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 \ \&\&x2$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \ \&\&!x1 \ \rightarrow \ !PMAxioms$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 5 and Critical Pair Lemma 9 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 2

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \ \&\& \ (!x1 \ || \ x2)) \ == \ (x1 \ \&\&x2)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 10, and apply the substitution:

$$!PMAxioms \ || \ x1 \ \rightarrow \ x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 8.

## Critical Pair Lemma 11

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \ \&\& \ (PMAxioms \ || \ !x1)) \ == \ (x1 \ || \ !PMAxioms)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \ \ || \ (x1 \ \&\&x2) \ \rightarrow \ x1 \ \&\& \ (PMAxioms \ || \ x2)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 \ \&\&x2$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \ \&\&!x1 \ \rightarrow \ !PMAxioms$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 4 and Critical Pair Lemma 9 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 3

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \ \&\& \ (PMAxioms \ || \ !x1)) \ == \ x1$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 11, and apply the substitution:

$$x1 \ \ || \ !PMAxioms \ \rightarrow \ x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 6.

## Critical Pair Lemma 12

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \ \&\& \ (PMAxioms \ || \ x2)) \ == \ (x1 \ || \ (x2 \ \&\&x1))$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \ \ || \ (x1 \ \&\&x2) \ \rightarrow \ x1 \ \&\& \ (PMAxioms \ || \ x2)$$

$$\lambda x_1. | ( \lambda x_1. \&\&x_2. ) \rightarrow \lambda x_1. \&\&x_2. ( \text{PM} \text{Axioms} | | \lambda x_1. )$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x_1. \&\&x_2.$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x_1. \&\&x_2. \leftrightarrow x_2. \&\&x_1.$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 4 and Equationalized Axiom 7 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 13

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x_1 | | x_1) == (x_1 \&\& ( \text{PM} \text{Axioms} | | !x_1 ) )$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x_1. | | ( !x_1. \&\&x_2. ) \rightarrow x_1. | | x_2.$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x_1. | | ( !x_1. \&\&x_2. )$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x_1. | | (x_2. \&\&x_1. ) \rightarrow x_1 \&\& ( \text{PM} \text{Axioms} | | x_2 )$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 1 and Critical Pair Lemma 12 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 4

It can be shown that:

$$(x_1 | | x_1) == x_1$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 13, and apply the substitution:

$$x_1. \&\& ( \text{PM} \text{Axioms} | | !x_1. ) \rightarrow x_1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 3.

### Critical Pair Lemma 14

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x_1 | | \text{PM} \text{Axioms}) == (x_1 | | !x_1)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x_1. | | ( !x_1. \&\&x_2. ) \rightarrow x_1. | | x_2.$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x_1. \&\&x_2.$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x_1. \&\& \text{PM} \text{Axioms} \rightarrow x_1$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 1 and Critical Pair Lemma 2 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 5

It can be shown that:

$$\lambda x_1. | | \text{PM} \text{Axioms} == \lambda x_1. | | !x_1$$

$$(x1 \mid PMAxioms) == PMAxioms$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 14, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid !x1\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 5.

### Critical Pair Lemma 15

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid x1) == (x1 \mid \mid !PMAxioms)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid (!x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \mid \mid x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1\_ \&\&x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&!x1\_ \rightarrow !PMAxioms$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 1 and Critical Pair Lemma 9 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 6

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid x1) == x1$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 15, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid !PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 6.

### Critical Pair Lemma 16

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid (x2\&\&x1)) == ((x1 \mid \mid x2) \&\&x1)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ ) \&\& (x1\_ \mid \mid x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \mid \mid (x2\&\&x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x3\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Substitution Lemma 4 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 7

It can be shown that:

$$(x1\&\&(PMAxioms \mid \mid x2)) == ((x1 \mid \mid x2) \&\&x1)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 16, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \&\&x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1\&\&(PMAxioms | | x2)$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 12.

**Critical Pair Lemma 17**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$PMAxioms = (PMAxioms | | x1)$$
**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | PMAxioms \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ | | PMAxioms$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ | | x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 5 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

**Substitution Lemma 8**

It can be shown that:

$$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \&\&x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1\&\&PMAxioms$$
**PROOF**

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 12, and apply the substitution:

$$PMAxioms | | x1\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 17.

**Substitution Lemma 9**

It can be shown that:

$$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \&\&x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$
**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 8, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\&PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 2.

**Substitution Lemma 10**

It can be shown that:

$$(x1\&\&PMAxioms) = (x1 | | x2) \&\&x1$$
**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 7, and apply the substitution:

$$PMAxioms | | x1\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 17.

## Substitution Lemma 11

It can be shown that:

$$x1 = ((x1 | x2) \&\&x1)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 10, and apply the substitution:

$$x1 \&\&PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 2.

## Substitution Lemma 12

It can be shown that:

$$x1 = (x1 \&\&(x1 | x2))$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 11, and apply the substitution:

$$x1 \&\&x2 \rightarrow x2 \&\&x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 7.

## Critical Pair Lemma 18

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 = (x1 \&\&(x2 | x1))$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\&(x1 | x2) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 | x2$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 | x2 \leftrightarrow x2 | x1$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 12 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 19

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | x2) = (x1 | x2 | x1)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$\text{Language`EquationalProofDump`getConstructRule[EquationalProof`ApplyLemma[168, x1 \&\&PMAxiom}$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2 \&\&x1$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\&(x1 | x2) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 9 and Substitution Lemma 12 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 20

### Critical Pair Lemma 20

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 == (x1 \&\& x1)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\& (x2\_ | | x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ | | x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 18 and Substitution Lemma 6 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 21

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& x2) == (x1 \&\& x2 \&\& x2)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\& (x2\_ | | x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ | | x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$\text{Language`EquationalProofDump`getConstructRule [EquationalProof`ApplyLemma [168, x1\_ \&\& PMAxiom$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 18 and Substitution Lemma 9 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 22

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | | x2 | | !x1) == (x1 | | !x1)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\& x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | | x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1\_ \&\& x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\& (x2\_ | | x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 1 and Critical Pair Lemma 18 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 13

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 | | x2 | | !x1) == PMAxioms$$

#### PROOF



We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 22, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | !x1\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 5.

### Substitution Lemma 14

It can be shown that:

$$(x1\_ | | x2) == (x1\_ | | x1\_ | | x2)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 19, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2\_ | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Critical Pair Lemma 23

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\_ | | ((x1\_ | | x2) \&\&x3)) == ((x1\_ | | x2) \&\&(x1\_ | | x3))$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ | | x2) \&\&(x1\_ | | x3) \rightarrow x1\_ | | (x2 \&\&x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x1\_ | | x2$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Substitution Lemma 14 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 15

It can be shown that:

$$(x1\_ | | ((x1\_ | | x2) \&\&x3)) == (x1\_ | | (x2 \&\&x3))$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 23, and apply the substitution:

$$(x1\_ | | x2) \&\&(x1\_ | | x3) \rightarrow x1\_ | | (x2 \&\&x3)$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 4.

### Critical Pair Lemma 24

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\_ | | (x2 \&\&(x1\_ | | x3))) == ((x1\_ | | x2) \&\&(x1\_ | | x3))$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ | | x2) \&\&(x1\_ | | x3) \rightarrow x1\_ | | (x2 \&\&x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ | | x3\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x1 | | x2$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Substitution Lemma 14 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 16

It can be shown that:

$$(x1\_ | | (x2 \& \& (x1\_ | | x3)) ) = (x1\_ | | (x2 \& \& x3))$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 24, and apply the substitution:

$$(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \& \& (x1\_ | | x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | | (x2 \& \& x3)$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 4.

### Substitution Lemma 17

It can be shown that:

$$x1 = (x1 \& \& x1)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 20, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \& \& x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \& \& x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 7.

### Substitution Lemma 18

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \& \& x2) = (x2 \& \& x1 \& \& x2)$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 21, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \& \& x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \& \& x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 7.

### Critical Pair Lemma 25

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \& \& x2 \& \& ! x1) = (x1 \& \& ! x1)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \& \& (! x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \& \& x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$! x1\_ | | x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$\text{Language`EquationalProofDump`getConstructRule[EquationalProof`ApplyLemma[168, x1\_ \& \& PMAxiom$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 2 and Substitution Lemma 9 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 19

It can be shown that:

Out[24]=

$$(x1 \&\& x2 \&\& !x1) == !PMAxioms$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 25, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& !x1\_ \rightarrow !PMAxioms$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 9.

## Critical Pair Lemma 26

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& x1) == (x1 \&\& PMAxioms)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (!x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1\_ \&\& x2\_$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1\_ | | x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | !x1\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 2 and Critical Pair Lemma 5 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 20

It can be shown that:

$$x1 == (x1 \&\& PMAxioms)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 26, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 17.

## Substitution Lemma 21

It can be shown that:

$$\text{True}$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 20, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\& PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 2.

## Critical Pair Lemma 27

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$PMAxioms == (!x1 | | x2 | | x1)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | !x1\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$\text{!x1\_}$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$\text{x1\_} \rightarrow \text{x1}$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 13 and Substitution Lemma 21 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 28

The following expressions are equivalent:

$(\text{!PMAxioms}) = (\text{!x1} \&\& \text{x2} \&\& \text{x1})$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$\text{x1\_} \&\& \text{x2\_} \&\& \text{!x1\_} \rightarrow \text{!PMAxioms}$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$\text{!x1\_}$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$\text{x1\_} \rightarrow \text{x1}$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 19 and Substitution Lemma 21 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 29

The following expressions are equivalent:

$(\text{!PMAxioms}) = (\text{!}(\text{x1} \mid \mid \text{x2}) \&\& \text{x1})$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$\text{!x1\_} \&\& \text{x2\_} \&\& \text{x1\_} \rightarrow \text{!PMAxioms}$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$\text{x2\_} \&\& \text{x1\_}$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$\text{x1\_} \&\& (\text{x1\_} \mid \mid \text{x2\_}) \rightarrow \text{x1}$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 28 and Substitution Lemma 12 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 22

It can be shown that:

$(\text{!PMAxioms}) = (\text{x1} \&\& \text{!}(\text{x1} \mid \mid \text{x2}))$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 29, and apply the substitution:

$\text{x1\_} \&\& \text{x2\_} \rightarrow \text{x2} \&\& \text{x1}$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 7.

### Critical Pair Lemma 30

The following expressions are equivalent:

$(\text{x1} \mid \mid \text{!}(\text{x1} \mid \mid \text{x2})) = (\text{x1} \mid \mid \text{!PMAxioms})$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | | x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1\_ \&\&x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&! (x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \rightarrow !PMAxioms$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 1 and Substitution Lemma 22 respectively.

**Substitution Lemma 23**

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 | | ! (!x1 | | x2) ) == x1$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 30, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | !PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 6.

**Critical Pair Lemma 31**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(! (!x1 | | x2) ) == (! (!x1 | | x2) \&\&x1)$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&(x2\_ | | x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ | | x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | ! (!x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 18 and Substitution Lemma 23 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 32**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 | | (x2\&\&(x2 | | x3) ) ) == (x1 | | x2 | | (x1\&\&x3) )$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | ( (x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \&\&x3\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | | (x2\&\&x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \&\&x3\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$(x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \&\&(x2\_ | | x3\_ ) \rightarrow x2 | | (x1\&\&x3)$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 15 and Critical Pair Lemma 1 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 24

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid x2) == (x1 \mid x2 \mid (x1 \&\&x3))$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 32, and apply the substitution:

$$x1 \&\&(x1 \mid x2) \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 12.

## Critical Pair Lemma 33

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid x2) == (x1 \mid (x1 \&\&x3) \mid x2)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \mid x2 \mid (x1 \&\&x3) \rightarrow x1 \mid x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2 \mid (x1 \&\&x3)$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \mid x2 \leftrightarrow x2 \mid x1$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 24 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 34

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid x2) == (x1 \mid x2 \mid (x3 \&\&x1))$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \mid x2 \mid (x1 \&\&x3) \rightarrow x1 \mid x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 \&\&x3$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\&x2 \&\&x1 \rightarrow x2 \&\&x1$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 24 and Substitution Lemma 18 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 35

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid x2) == (x1 \mid (x3 \&\&x1) \mid x2)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \mid (x1 \&\&x2) \mid x3 \rightarrow x1 \mid x3$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 \&\&x2$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&x2\_ \&\&x1\_ \rightarrow x2\&\&x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 33 and Substitution Lemma 18 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 36

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\_ | |x2\_ | |x3) = (x1\_ | |x2\_ | |x3 | |x1)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | |x2\_ | | (x3\_ \&\&x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1\_ | |x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x3\_ \&\&x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x1\_ | |x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 34 and Substitution Lemma 12 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 37

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\_ | |x2\_ | |x3) = (x1\_ | |x2\_ | |x2\_ | |x3)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \&\&x1\_ ) | |x3 \rightarrow x1\_ | |x3$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ \&\&x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\& (x2\_ | |x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 35 and Critical Pair Lemma 18 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 25

It can be shown that:

$$(! ( !x1\_ | |x2 ) ) = (x1\&\&! ( !x1\_ | |x2 ) )$$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 31, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \&\&x2\_ \rightarrow x2\&\&x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 7.

### Critical Pair Lemma 38

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1\_ | |x2\_ | |x3) = (x3\_ | |x1\_ | |x1\_ | |x2)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | x3\_ | | x1\_ \rightarrow x1 | | x2 | | x3$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | x3\_ | | x1\_$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ | | x1\_$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 36 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 26

It can be shown that:

$(x1 | | x2 | | x3) == (x3 | | x1 | | x2)$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 38, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | x2\_ | | x3\_ \rightarrow x1 | | x2 | | x3$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 37.

## Critical Pair Lemma 39

The following expressions are equivalent:

**True**

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | x3\_ \leftrightarrow x3\_ | | x1\_ | | x2\_$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | x3\_$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ | | x1\_$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 26 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 40

The following expressions are equivalent:

$(x1 | | x2 | | ! (x1 | | x2) ) == PMAxioms$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | x3\_ \rightarrow x1 | | x2 | | x3$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | x3\_$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | ! x1\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 39 and Critical Pair Lemma 5 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 41



The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid (!x1 \mid x2))) = (x1 \&\& PMAxioms)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\& (!x1 \mid x2) \rightarrow x1 \&\& x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1 \mid x2$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \mid x2 \mid \mid (!x1 \mid x2) \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 2 and Critical Pair Lemma 40 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 27

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid (!x1 \mid x2))) = x1$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 41, and apply the substitution:

$$x1 \&\& PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 2.

## Critical Pair Lemma 42

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& (!x2 \mid x1))) = (x1 \mid x2)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& (x1 \mid x3)) \rightarrow x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& x3)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2 \&\& (x1 \mid x3)$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid (!x1 \mid x2)) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 16 and Substitution Lemma 27 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 28

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid (!x2 \mid x1)) = (x1 \mid x2)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 42, and apply the substitution:

$$x1 \&\& (!x1 \mid x2) \rightarrow (!x1 \mid x2)$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 25.

## Substitution Lemma 29

It can be shown that:

$$(!x_2 | y_1) | (!x_2 | z_0) | (!y_1 | z_0) == (a_0 | !a_0)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Equationalized Hypothesis 1, and apply the substitution:

$$x1_ | x2_ \rightarrow x2 | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

**Substitution Lemma 30**

It can be shown that:

$$(!x_2 | z_0) | (!y_1 | z_0) | (!x_2 | y_1) == (a_0 | !a_0)$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 29, and apply the substitution:

$$x1_ | x2_ \rightarrow x2 | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

**Substitution Lemma 31**

It can be shown that:

$$(!x_2 | z_0) | (!y_1 | z_0) | (!x_2 | y_1) == \text{PMAxioms}$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 30, and apply the substitution:

$$a_0 | !a_0 \rightarrow \text{PMAxioms}$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 6.

**Substitution Lemma 32**

It can be shown that:

$$(!x_2 | z_0) | (!y_1 | z_0) | (!x_2 | y_1) == \text{PMAxioms}$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 31, and apply the substitution:

$$x1_ | x2_ | x3_ \rightarrow x1 | x2 | x3$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 39.

**Substitution Lemma 33**

It can be shown that:

$$(!x_2 | z_0) | (!y_1 | z_0) | (!x_2 | y_1) == \text{PMAxioms}$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 32, and apply the substitution:

$$x1_ | x2_ | x3_ \rightarrow x1 | x2 | x3$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 39.

**Substitution Lemma 34**

It can be shown that:

$$(!x_2 \mid \mid z_0 \mid \mid y_1 \mid \mid !(!x_2 \mid \mid y_1)) == \text{PMAxioms}$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 33, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid !(!x_2 \mid \mid x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \mid \mid x2$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 28.

### Substitution Lemma 35

It can be shown that:

$$(!x_2 \mid \mid y_1 \mid \mid z_0 \mid \mid !(!x_2 \mid \mid y_1)) == \text{PMAxioms}$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 34, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 36

It can be shown that:

$$(!x_2 \mid \mid y_1 \mid \mid z_0 \mid \mid !(y_1 \mid \mid !x_2)) == \text{PMAxioms}$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 35, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 37

It can be shown that:

$$(!x_2 \mid \mid !(y_1 \mid \mid !x_2) \mid \mid y_1 \mid \mid z_0) == \text{PMAxioms}$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 36, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 38

It can be shown that:

$$(! (y_1 \mid \mid !x_2) \mid \mid y_1 \mid \mid z_0 \mid \mid !x_2) == \text{PMAxioms}$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 37, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 39

It can be shown that:

$$(! (!x_2 \mid \mid v_1) \mid \mid v_1 \mid \mid z_0 \mid \mid !x_2) == \text{PMAxioms}$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 38, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | |x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | |x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

**Substitution Lemma 40**

It can be shown that:

$$(! (!x2 | |y1) | |y1 | |z_0 | |!x2) == PMAxioms$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 39, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | |x2\_ | |x3\_ \rightarrow x1 | |x2 | |x3$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 39.

**Substitution Lemma 41**

It can be shown that:

$$(! (!x2 | |y1) | |y1 | |z_0 | |!x2) == PMAxioms$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 40, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | |x2\_ | |x3\_ \rightarrow x1 | |x2 | |x3$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 39.

**Substitution Lemma 42**

It can be shown that:

$$(! (!x2 | |y1) | |z_0 | |!x2 | |y1) == PMAxioms$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 41, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | |x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | |x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

**Substitution Lemma 43**

It can be shown that:

$$(! (y1 | |!x2) | |z_0 | |!x2 | |y1) == PMAxioms$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 42, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | |x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | |x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

**Substitution Lemma 44**

It can be shown that:

$$(! (y1 | |!x2) | |z_0 | |!x2 | |y1) == PMAxioms$$

**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 43, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ | | x3\_ \rightarrow x1 | | x2 | | x3$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 39.

**Substitution Lemma 45**

It can be shown that:

$$(! (y_1 | | !x_2) | | z_0 | | y_1 | | !x_2) == PMAxioms$$
**PROOF**

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 44, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

**Conclusion 1**

We obtain the conclusion:

**True**

**PROOF**


Take Substitution Lemma 45, and apply the substitution:

$$!x1\_ | | x2\_ | | x1\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 27.

## APPENDIX 7. Proof of PM implies CN2.

In[25]:= proofPMimpCN2 ["ProofNotebook"]



### Axiom 1

We are given that:

**PMAxioms**

### Hypothesis 1

We would like to show that:

$\forall_{\{x,y\}} (x \Rightarrow (\neg x \Rightarrow y))$

### Equationalized Axiom 1

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$x1 == (x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& \neg x2))$

### Equationalized Axiom 2

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$x1 == (x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid \neg x2))$

### Equationalized Axiom 3

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$(x1 \mid \mid x2) == (x2 \mid \mid x1)$

### Equationalized Axiom 4

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$(x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& x3)) == ((x1 \mid \mid x2) \&\& (x1 \mid \mid x3))$

### Equationalized Axiom 5

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$((x1 \&\& x2) \mid \mid (x1 \&\& x3)) == (x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid x3))$

### Equationalized Axiom 6

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$(a_0 \mid \mid \neg a_0) == \text{PMAxioms}$

### Equationalized Axiom 7

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$(x1 \&\& x2) == (x2 \&\& x1)$

### Equationalized Hypothesis 1

We generate the "equationalized" hypothesis:

$(\neg x1 \mid \mid x1 \mid \mid y_0) == (a_0 \mid \mid \neg a_0)$

### Critical Derivation 1

### Critical Pair Lemma 1

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 == (x1 \&\& PMAxioms)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\& (x2 \_ | | !x2 \_) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2 \_ | | !x2 \_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$a_0 \_ | | !a_0 \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 2 and Equationalized Axiom 6 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 2

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 == (PMAxioms \&\& x1)$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\& PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 \&\& PMAxioms$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\& x2 \_ \leftrightarrow x2 \_ \&\& x1 \_$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 1 and Equationalized Axiom 7 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 3

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \&\& (PMAxioms \_ | | x2 \_)) == (x1 \_ | | (x1 \&\& x2 \_))$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$(x1 \&\& x2 \_ | | (x1 \&\& x3 \_)) \rightarrow x1 \&\& (x2 \_ | | x3 \_)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1 \&\& x2 \_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1 \&\& PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 5 and Critical Pair Lemma 1 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 4

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \_ | | !x1 \_) == PMAxioms$$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$\text{PMAxioms} \&\& x1 \rightarrow x1$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$\text{PMAxioms} \&\& x1 \_$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1 \_ \&\& (x2 \_ \mid \mid !x2 \_) \rightarrow x1$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 2 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 5

The following expressions are equivalent:

$x1 = (x1 \mid \mid !\text{PMAxioms})$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$x1 \_ \mid \mid (x2 \_ \&\& !x2 \_) \rightarrow x1$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$x2 \_ \&\& !x2 \_$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$\text{PMAxioms} \&\& x1 \rightarrow x1$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 1 and Critical Pair Lemma 2 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 6

The following expressions are equivalent:

$(x1 \mid \mid (!x1 \&\& x2)) = (\text{PMAxioms} \&\& (x1 \mid \mid x2))$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$(x1 \_ \mid \mid x2 \_) \&\& (x1 \_ \mid \mid x3 \_) \rightarrow x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& x3)$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$x1 \_ \mid \mid x2 \_$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1 \_ \mid \mid !x1 \_ \rightarrow \text{PMAxioms}$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Critical Pair Lemma 4 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 1

It can be shown that:

$(x1 \mid \mid (!x1 \&\& x2)) = (x1 \mid \mid x2)$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 6, and apply the substitution:

$\text{PMAxioms} \&\& x1 \rightarrow x1$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 2.

### Critical Pair Lemma 7



The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 == (!PMAxioms | | x1)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | !PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ | | !PMAxioms$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ | | x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 5 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 8

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \& \& !x1) == !PMAxioms$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$!PMAxioms | | x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!PMAxioms | | x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \& \& !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 7 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 9

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \& \& (PMAxioms | | !x1)) == (x1 | | !PMAxioms)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ | | (x1\_ \& \& x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \& \& (PMAxioms | | x2)$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \& \& x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \& \& !x1\_ \rightarrow !PMAxioms$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 3 and Critical Pair Lemma 8 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 2

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \& \& (PMAxioms | | !x1)) == x1$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 9, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ | | !PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 5.

### Critical Pair Lemma 10

The following expressions are equivalent:

$(x1 \&\& (PMAxioms | | x2)) = (x1 | | (x2 \&\& x1))$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | (x1\_ \&\& x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \&\& (PMAxioms | | x2)$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$x1\_ \&\& x2\_$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1\_ \&\& x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ \&\& x1\_$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 3 and Equationalized Axiom 7 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 11

The following expressions are equivalent:

$(x1 | | x1) = (x1 \&\& (PMAxioms | | !x1))$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\& x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | | x2$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\& x2\_ )$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | (x2\_ \&\& x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \&\& (PMAxioms | | x2)$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 1 and Critical Pair Lemma 10 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 3

It can be shown that:

$(x1 | | x1) = x1$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 11, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ \&\& (PMAxioms | | !x1\_ ) \rightarrow x1$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 2.

### Critical Pair Lemma 12

The following expressions are equivalent:

$(x1 | | PMAxioms) = (x1 | | !x1)$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \&\& x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | | x2$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$!x1 \ \&\&x2$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1 \ \&\&PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 1 and Critical Pair Lemma 1 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 4

It can be shown that:

$(x1 \ | \ PMAxioms) \ == \ PMAxioms$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 12, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ \ | \ !x1\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 4.

### Critical Pair Lemma 13

The following expressions are equivalent:

$(x1 \ | \ (x2 \ \&\&x1)) \ == \ ((x1 \ | \ x2) \ \&\&x1)$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$(x1\_ \ | \ |x2\_ \ \&\&(x1\_ \ | \ |x3\_ \ \rightarrow x1 \ | \ |x2 \ \&\&x3)$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$x1\_ \ | \ |x3\_ \$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1\_ \ | \ |x1\_ \ \rightarrow x1$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Substitution Lemma 3 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 5

It can be shown that:

$(x1 \ \&\&(PMAxioms \ | \ x2)) \ == \ ((x1 \ | \ x2) \ \&\&x1)$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 13, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ \ | \ |x2 \ \&\&x1\_ \ \rightarrow x1 \ \&\&(PMAxioms \ | \ x2)$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 10.

### Critical Pair Lemma 14

The following expressions are equivalent:

$PMAxioms \ == \ (PMAxioms \ | \ x1)$

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$x1\_ \ | \ |PMAxioms \ \rightarrow PMAxioms$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$x1\_ | | PMAxioms$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ | | x1\_$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 4 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 6

It can be shown that:

$(x1 \& \& PMAxioms) = (x1 | | x2) \& \& x1$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 5, and apply the substitution:

$PMAxioms | | x1\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 14.

## Substitution Lemma 7

It can be shown that:

$x1 = ((x1 | | x2) \& \& x1)$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 6, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ \& \& PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 1.

## Substitution Lemma 8

It can be shown that:

$x1 = (x1 \& \& (x1 | | x2))$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 7, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ \& \& x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \& \& x1$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 7.

## Critical Pair Lemma 15

The following expressions are equivalent:

$(x1 | | !x1 | | x2) = (x1 | | !x1)$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$x1\_ | | (!x1\_ \& \& x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1 | | x2$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$!x1\_ \& \& x2\_$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$x1\_ \& \& (x1\_ | | x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 1 and Substitution Lemma 8 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 9

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid \mid !x1 \mid \mid x2) == PMAxioms$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 15, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid !x1\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 4.

## Substitution Lemma 10

It can be shown that:

$$(!x1 \mid \mid x1 \mid \mid y_0) == PMAxioms$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Equationalized Hypothesis 1, and apply the substitution:

$$a_0 \mid \mid !a_0 \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 6.

## Conclusion 1

We obtain the conclusion:

**True**

### PROOF


Take Substitution Lemma 10, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid \mid !x1\_ \mid \mid x2\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 9.

## APPENDIX 8. Proof of PM implies CN3.

In[26]:= proofPMimpCN3 ["ProofNotebook"]



### Axiom 1

We are given that:

**PMAxioms**

### Hypothesis 1

We would like to show that:

$\forall x ( (\neg x \Rightarrow x) \Rightarrow x )$

### Equationalized Axiom 1

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$x1 == (x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& \neg x2) )$

### Equationalized Axiom 2

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$x1 == (x1 \&\& (x2 \mid \mid \neg x2) )$

### Equationalized Axiom 3

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$(x1 \mid \mid x2) == (x2 \mid \mid x1)$

### Equationalized Axiom 4

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$(x1 \mid \mid (x2 \&\& x3) ) == ( (x1 \mid \mid x2) \&\& (x1 \mid \mid x3) )$

### Equationalized Axiom 5

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$(a_0 \mid \mid \neg a_0) == \text{PMAxioms}$

### Equationalized Axiom 6

We generate the "equationalized" axiom:

$(x1 \&\& x2) == (x2 \&\& x1)$

### Equationalized Hypothesis 1

We generate the "equationalized" hypothesis:

$( \neg (x_0 \mid \mid x_0) \mid \mid x_0 ) == ( \neg a_0 \mid \mid \neg a_0 )$

### Critical Pair Lemma 1

The following expressions are equivalent:

$x1 == (x1 \&\& \text{PMAxioms})$

**Done**

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&(x2\_ || !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ || !x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$a_0 || !a_0 \rightarrow PMAxioms$$

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 2 and Equationalized Axiom 5 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 2**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 == (PMAxioms \&\& x1)$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x1\_ \&\&PMAxioms$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&x2\_ \leftrightarrow x2\_ \&\&x1\_$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 1 and Equationalized Axiom 6 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 3**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 || !x1) == PMAxioms$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$PMAxioms \&\& x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$PMAxioms \&\& x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&(x2\_ || !x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 2 and Equationalized Axiom 2 respectively.

**Critical Pair Lemma 4**

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$x1 == (x1 || !PMAxioms)$$

**PROOF**

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ || (x2\_ \&\&!x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$x2\_ \&\&!x2\_$$

`PM_Axioms`

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

`PM_Axioms && x1 → x1`

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 1 and Critical Pair Lemma 2 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 5

The following expressions are equivalent:

`(x1 | | (!x1 && x2)) == (PM_Axioms && (x1 | | x2))`

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

`(x1_ | | x2_) && (x1_ | | x3_) → x1 | | (x2 && x3)`

contains a subpattern of the form:

`x1_ | | x2_`

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

`x1_ | | !x1_ → PM_Axioms`

where these rules follow from Equationalized Axiom 4 and Critical Pair Lemma 3 respectively.

### Substitution Lemma 1

It can be shown that:

`(x1 | | (!x1 && x2)) == (x1 | | x2)`

#### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 5, and apply the substitution:

`PM_Axioms && x1 → x1`

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 2.

### Critical Pair Lemma 6

The following expressions are equivalent:

`x1 == (!PM_Axioms | | x1)`

#### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

`x1_ | | !PM_Axioms → x1`

contains a subpattern of the form:

`x1_ | | !PM_Axioms`

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

`x1_ | | x2_ ↔ x2_ | | x1_`

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 4 and Equationalized Axiom 3 respectively.

### Critical Pair Lemma 7

The following expressions are equivalent:

`(x1 && !x1) == !PM_Axioms`

#### PROOF

Out[26]=



Note that the input for the rule:

$$!PMAxioms \mid x1\_ \rightarrow x1$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!PMAxioms \mid x1\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \mid (x2\_ \&\&!x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1$$

where these rules follow from Critical Pair Lemma 6 and Equationalized Axiom 1 respectively.

## Critical Pair Lemma 8

The following expressions are equivalent:

$$(x1 \mid x1) == (x1 \mid !PMAxioms)$$

### PROOF

Note that the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \mid (!x1\_ \&\&x2\_ ) \rightarrow x1 \mid x2$$

contains a subpattern of the form:

$$!x1\_ \&\&x2\_$$

which can be unified with the input for the rule:

$$x1\_ \&\&!x1\_ \rightarrow !PMAxioms$$

where these rules follow from Substitution Lemma 1 and Critical Pair Lemma 7 respectively.

## Substitution Lemma 2

It can be shown that:

$$(x1 \mid x1) == x1$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Critical Pair Lemma 8, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid !PMAxioms \rightarrow x1$$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 4.

## Substitution Lemma 3

It can be shown that:

$$(! (x_\theta \mid x_\theta) \mid x_\theta) == (a_\theta \mid ! a_\theta)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Equationalized Hypothesis 1, and apply the substitution:

$$x1\_ \mid x2\_ \rightarrow x2 \mid x1$$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

## Substitution Lemma 4

It can be shown that:

$$(x_\theta \mid ! (x_\theta \mid x_\theta)) == (a_\theta \mid ! a_\theta)$$

### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 3, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ | | x2\_ \rightarrow x2 | | x1$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 3.

### Substitution Lemma 5

It can be shown that:

$(x_\theta | | ! (x_\theta | | x_\theta) ) == PMAxioms$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 4, and apply the substitution:

$a_\theta | | ! a_\theta \rightarrow PMAxioms$

which follows from Equationalized Axiom 5.

### Substitution Lemma 6

It can be shown that:

$(x_\theta | | ! x_\theta) == PMAxioms$

#### PROOF

We start by taking Substitution Lemma 5, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ | | x1\_ \rightarrow x1$

which follows from Substitution Lemma 2.

### Conclusion 1

We obtain the conclusion:

**True**

#### PROOF

Take Substitution Lemma 6, and apply the substitution:

$x1\_ | | ! x1\_ \rightarrow PMAxioms$

which follows from Critical Pair Lemma 3.

## REFERENCES

- [1] Łukasiewicz J. *Elements of Mathematical Logic*. Second Edition (1958). Trans. by Wojtasiewicz O. Pergamon Press. 1963.
- [2] Russell B and Whitehead AN. *Principia Mathematica*. Volume I (1910). Merchant Books. 2009.
- [3] Wolfram Research. (2021). *Mathematica Home Edition*. v12.1.1.
- [4] Baader F and Nipkow T. (1999). *Term Rewriting and All That*. Cambridge University Press.
- [5] Suppes P. (1972). *Axiomatic Set Theory*. Dover.
- [6] Knuth DE and Bendix PB. (1970). Simple word problems in universal algebras. In J. Leech, ed. *Computational Problems in Abstract Algebra*. Pergamon Press. pp. 263-297.